

[Create an Alert for This Case on RECAP](#)

CLOSED

**United States District Court
Western District of Michigan (Southern Division (1))
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:20-cv-00360-PLM-PJG**

Signature Sothebys International Realty, Inc. et al v.
Whitmer et al
Assigned to: District Judge Paul L. Maloney
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Phillip J. Green (events
as ordered)
Related Case: [1:20-cv-00570-PLM-PJG](#)
Cause: 28:1331 Fed. Question

Date Filed: 04/28/2020
Date Terminated: 12/02/2020
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights:
Other
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

plaintiff

**Signature Sotheby's International
Realty, Inc.**

represented by **Daniel J. McCarthy**
Butzel Long PC (Detroit)
150 W Jefferson Ave., Ste. 100
Detroit, MI 48226
(313) 225-7000
Email: mccarthyd@butzel.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph E. Richotte
Butzel Long PC (Troy)
201 W Big Beaver Rd., Ste. 1200
Troy, MI 48084
(248) 258-1616
Fax: (248) 258-1439
Email: richotte@butzel.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

plaintiff

**Executive Property Maintenance,
Inc.**

represented by **Daniel J. McCarthy**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph E. Richotte

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

plaintiff

Intraco Corporation Inc.

represented by **Daniel J. McCarthy**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph E. Richotte
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

plaintiff

Casite Intraco LLC

represented by **Daniel J. McCarthy**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph E. Richotte
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

plaintiff

Bahash & Company LLC
doing business as
Hillsdale Jewelers

represented by **Daniel J. McCarthy**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph E. Richotte
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

plaintiff

**William A. Shortt, D.D.S. &
Therese F. Shortt, D.D.S, P.C.**
doing business as
Shortt Dental

represented by **Joseph E. Richotte**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Daniel J. McCarthy
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

plaintiff

Midwest Carwash Association

represented by **Joseph E. Richotte**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Daniel J. McCarthy
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

defendant

Gretchen E. Whitmer

represented by **Christopher M. Allen**
MI Dept Attorney General (Solicitor
General)
525 W Ottawa St.
P.O. Box 30212
Lansing, MI 48909
(517) 335-7628
Email: allenc28@michigan.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Darrin F. Fowler
MI Dept Attorney General
(Community Health)
Community Health Division
525 W Ottawa
P.O. Box 30758
Lansing, MI 48909
(517) 373-1160
Fax: (517) 335-6755
Email: fowlerdf@michigan.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John G. Fedynsky
Michigan Department of Attorney
General
Civil Litigation, Employment &
Elections
525 W Ottawa St.
P.O. Box 30736
Lansing, MI 48909
(517) 335-3055
Fax: (517) 335-7157
Email: fedynskyj@michigan.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph T. Froehlich
MI Dept Attorney General (State
Operations)
State Operations Division
P.O. Box 30754
Lansing, MI 48909
(517) 335-7573
Fax: (517) 335-7157
Email: froehlichj1@michigan.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joshua O. Booth
MI Dept Attorney General
(Licensing/Regulation)
Licensing and Regulation Division
525 W Ottawa St., 3rd Floor
P.O. Box 30758
Lansing, MI 48909
(517) 335-7569
Email: Boothj2@michigan.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

defendant

Robert Gordon

represented by **Christopher M. Allen**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Darrin F. Fowler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John G. Fedynsky
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph T. Froehlich
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joshua O. Booth
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

movant

Michigan Epidemiologists

represented by **Jonathan R. Kay**
Kaplan Hecker & Fink LLP
350 Fifth Ave., Ste. 7110
New York, NY 10118
(212) 763-0883
Fax: (212) 564-0883
Email: jkay@kaplanhecker.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joshua Adam Matz
Kaplan Hecker & Fink LLP
350 Fifth Ave., Ste. 7110
New York, NY 10118
(212) 763-0883
Fax: (212) 564-0883
Email: jmatz@kaplanhecker.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mahrah Meher Taufique
Kaplan Hecker & Fink LLP
350 Fifth Ave., Ste. 7110
New York, NY 10118
(212) 763-0883
Email:
mtaufique@kaplanhecker.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Raymond P. Tolentino
Kaplan Hecker & Fink LLP
350 Fifth Ave., Ste. 7110
New York, NY 10118
(212) 763-0883
Fax: (212) 564-0883
Email:
rtolentino@kaplanhecker.com
TERMINATED: 09/29/2020
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

interested party

United States of America

represented by **Andrew Byerly Birge**
U.S. Attorney (Grand Rapids)
The Law Bldg.
330 Ionia Ave., NW

P.O. Box 208
Grand Rapids, MI 49501-0208
(616) 456-2404
Email: andrew.birge@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
04/28/2020	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT with jury demand <i>for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief</i> against Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer filed by Signature Sothebys International Realty, Inc., Casite Intraco, LLC, Intraco Corporation, INC., Executive Pproperty Mintenance, Inc., Bahash & Company, LLC, d/b/a Hillsdale Jewelers (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1) (McCarthy, Daniel) Modified text on 4/29/2020 to change unnecessary capitalization (ns). (Entered: 04/28/2020)
04/28/2020	<u>2</u>	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by Casite Intraco, LLC, (McCarthy, Daniel); Modified text on 4/29/2020; Casite Intraco, LLC is the only entity listed by the corporate disclosure statement (ns). (Entered: 04/28/2020)
04/29/2020	<u>3</u>	NOTICE that this case has been assigned Paul L. Maloney ; with NOTICE OF DEFICIENCY re filing fee re corporate disclosure statement (ns) (Entered: 04/29/2020)
04/29/2020		SUMMONS NOT ISSUED ; <i>filing fee due, none provided</i> (ns) (Entered: 04/29/2020)
04/30/2020		FILING FEE PAID re <u>1</u> by plaintiffs Bahash & Company LLC, Casite Intraco LLC, Executive Property Management, Inc., Intraco Corporation Inc., Signature Sotheby's International Realty, Inc. in the amount of \$400, receipt number AMIWDC-5192417 (McCarthy, Daniel) (Entered: 04/30/2020)
04/30/2020	<u>4</u>	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by Signature Sotheby's International Realty, Inc. identifying Corporate Parent Signature Sothebeys International Realty, Inc. for Signature Sotheby's International Realty, Inc. (McCarthy, Daniel) (Entered: 04/30/2020)
04/30/2020	<u>5</u>	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by Executive Property Management, Inc. identifying Corporate Parent EXECUTIVE PROPERTY MAINTENANCE, INC. for Executive Property Management, Inc. (McCarthy, Daniel) (Entered: 04/30/2020)

04/30/2020	<u>6</u>	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by Intraco Corporation Inc. identifying Corporate Parent INTRACO CORPORATION, INC. for Intraco Corporation Inc. (McCarthy, Daniel) (Entered: 04/30/2020)
04/30/2020	<u>7</u>	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by Bahash & Company LLC (McCarthy, Daniel) (Entered: 04/30/2020)
05/11/2020	<u>8</u>	<i>FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT For Declaratory and Injunctive Relief</i> against All Defendants filed by Intraco Corporation Inc., Executive Property Management, Inc., Casite Intraco LLC, Signature Sotheby's International Realty, Inc., Bahash & Company LLC, William A. Shortt, D.D.S. & Therese F. Shortt, D.D.S, P.C., d/b/a Shortt Dental, Midwest Carwash Association (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1) (McCarthy, Daniel) Modified text on 5/12/2020 to change unnecessary capitalization (ns). (Entered: 05/11/2020)
05/11/2020	<u>9</u>	PROPOSED SUMMONS to be issued re <u>8</u> (McCarthy, Daniel) (Entered: 05/11/2020)
05/11/2020	<u>10</u>	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by Midwest Carwash Association (McCarthy, Daniel) Modified text on 5/12/2020 to change unnecessary capitalization (ns). (Entered: 05/11/2020)
05/11/2020	<u>11</u>	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by William A. Shortt, D.D.S. & Therese F. Shortt, D.D.S, P.C., d/b/a Shortt Dental (McCarthy, Daniel) Modified text on 5/12/2020 to change unnecessary capitalization (ns). (Entered: 05/11/2020)
05/12/2020	<u>12</u>	SUMMONS ISSUED as to defendants Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer (ns) (Entered: 05/12/2020)
05/15/2020		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Joseph E. Richotte on behalf of plaintiffs Bahash & Company LLC, Casite Intraco LLC, Executive Property Maintenance, Inc., Intraco Corporation Inc., Midwest Carwash Association, Signature Sotheby's International Realty, Inc., William A. Shortt, D.D.S. & Therese F. Shortt, D.D.S, P.C. (Richotte, Joseph) (Entered: 05/15/2020)
05/18/2020	<u>13</u>	SUMMONS returned executed; Robert Gordon served on 5/15/2020, answer due 6/5/2020; Gretchen E. Whitmer served on 5/15/2020, answer due 6/5/2020 (McCarthy, Daniel) Modified text on 5/18/2020 (ns). (Entered: 05/18/2020)
05/20/2020		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of John G. Fedynsky on behalf of defendants Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer (Fedynsky, John) (Entered: 05/20/2020)

05/20/2020		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Joseph T. Froehlich on behalf of defendants Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer (Froehlich, Joseph) (Entered: 05/20/2020)
05/20/2020		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Joshua O. Booth on behalf of defendants Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer (Booth, Joshua) (Entered: 05/20/2020)
05/20/2020		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Christopher M. Allen on behalf of defendants Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer (Allen, Christopher) (Entered: 05/20/2020)
05/22/2020		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Darrin F. Fowler on behalf of defendants Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer (Fowler, Darrin) (Entered: 05/22/2020)
05/29/2020		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Andrew Byerly Birge on behalf of interested party United States of America ; party United States of America added (Birge, Andrew) (Entered: 05/29/2020)
05/29/2020	14	BRIEF by interested party United States of America <i>statement of interest</i> (Birge, Andrew) (Entered: 05/29/2020)
06/05/2020	15	MOTION for leave to file excess pages / <i>Exceed Word Limit</i> by defendants Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer; (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1: Defs. Whitmer and Gordon's Motion to Dismiss, # 2 Brief in Support of Defs. Whitmer and Gordon's Motion to Dismiss, # 3 Index of Exhibits, # 4 Exhibit A: April 29, 2020 Opinion and Order Denying Plaintiffs Motion for, # 5 Exhibit B: Modes of transmission of virus causing COVID-19, World Health, # 6 Exhibit C: Social Distancing, Quarantine, and Isolation, Centers for, # 7 Exhibit D: Flattening the Coronavirus Curve (March 27, 2020), New York, # 8 Exhibit E: E.O. No. 2020-4, # 9 Exhibit F: E.O. No. 2020-5, # 10 Exhibit G: E.O. No. 2020-9, # 11 Exhibit H: E.O. No. 2020-11, # 12 Exhibit I: E.O. 2020-17, # 13 Exhibit J: E.O. 2020-96, # 14 Exhibit K: E.O. No. 2020-21, # 15 Exhibit L: E.O. 2020-110, # 16 Exhibit M: South Bay United Pentecostal Church, et al. v. Gavin Newsom,) (Fedynsky, John) (Entered: 06/05/2020)
06/08/2020	16	ORDER granting 15 motion for leave to file excess pages/exceed word limitations; signed by District Judge Paul L. Maloney (Judge Paul L. Maloney, acr) (Entered: 06/08/2020)
06/08/2020	17	MOTION to dismiss by defendants Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer; (ns) (Entered: 06/09/2020)

06/08/2020	<u>18</u>	BRIEF in support of MOTION to dismiss <u>17</u> filed by Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Index, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C, # <u>5</u> Exhibit D, # <u>6</u> Exhibit E, # <u>7</u> Exhibit F, # <u>8</u> Exhibit G, # <u>9</u> Exhibit H, # <u>10</u> Exhibit I, # <u>11</u> Exhibit J, # <u>12</u> Exhibit K, # <u>13</u> Exhibit L, # <u>14</u> Exhibit M) (ns) (Entered: 06/09/2020)
06/12/2020		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Joshua Adam Matz on behalf of amicus Amici Curiae Michigan Epidemiologists ; party Amici Curiae Michigan Epidemiologists added (Matz, Joshua) (Entered: 06/12/2020)
06/12/2020		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Raymond P. Tolentino on behalf of amicus Amici Curiae Michigan Epidemiologists (Tolentino, Raymond) (Entered: 06/12/2020)
06/12/2020		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Jonathan R. Kay on behalf of amicus Amici Curiae Michigan Epidemiologists (Kay, Jonathan) (Entered: 06/12/2020)
06/12/2020		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Mahrah Taufique on behalf of amicus Amici Curiae Michigan Epidemiologists (Taufique, Mahrah) (Entered: 06/12/2020)
06/12/2020	<u>19</u>	MOTION for leave to file <i>Brief of Amici Curiae Michigan Epidemiologists in Support of Defendants' Motion to Dismiss</i> by amicus Amici Curiae Michigan Epidemiologists ; (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A - Brief of Amici Curiae Michigan Epidemiologists in Support of Defendants' Motion to Dismiss) (Matz, Joshua) (Entered: 06/12/2020)
06/15/2020	<u>20</u>	ORDER regarding Motion for Leave to File amicus brief <u>19</u> and certificate of concurrence; motion held in abeyance pending filing of certificate; signed by District Judge Paul L. Maloney (Judge Paul L. Maloney, acr) (Entered: 06/15/2020)
06/16/2020	<u>21</u>	CERTIFICATE regarding compliance with LCivR 7.1(d) re MOTION for leave to file <i>Brief of Amici Curiae Michigan Epidemiologists in Support of Defendants' Motion to Dismiss</i> <u>19</u> filed by Michigan Epidemiologists (Matz, Joshua) (Entered: 06/16/2020)
06/30/2020	<u>22</u>	RESPONSE in opposition to MOTION for leave to file <i>Brief of Amici Curiae Michigan Epidemiologists in Support of Defendants' Motion to Dismiss</i> <u>19</u> filed by Bahash & Company LLC, Casite Intraco LLC, Executive Property Maintenance, Inc., Intraco Corporation Inc., Midwest Carwash Association, Signature Sotheby's International Realty, Inc., William A. Shortt, D.D.S. & Therese F.

		Shortt, D.D.S, P.C. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1) (McCarthy, Daniel) (Entered: 06/30/2020)
07/02/2020	23	REPLY to response to motion 19 for leave to file <i>Brief of Amici Curiae Michigan Epidemiologists in Support of Defendants' Motion to Dismiss</i> filed by Michigan Epidemiologists (Matz, Joshua) (Entered: 07/02/2020)
07/06/2020	24	MOTION for leave to file excess pages <i>FOR RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO GOVERNMENT'S MOTION TO DISMISS</i> by plaintiffs Bahash & Company LLC, Casite Intraco LLC, Executive Property Maintenance, Inc., Intraco Corporation Inc., Midwest Carwash Association, Signature Sotheby's International Realty, Inc., William A. Shortt, D.D.S. & Therese F. Shortt, D.D.S, P.C.; (Attachments: # 1 Proposed Response to Government's Motion to Dismiss, # 2 Proposed Index of Exhibits, # 3 Proposed Exhibit 1, # 4 Proposed Exhibit 2, # 5 Proposed Exhibit 3, # 6 Proposed Exhibit 4) (Richotte, Joseph) (Entered: 07/06/2020)
07/08/2020	25	ORDER granting 24 motion for leave to file excess pages/exceed word limitations; signed by District Judge Paul L. Maloney (Judge Paul L. Maloney, acr) (Entered: 07/08/2020)
07/08/2020	26	RESPONSE TO MOTION to dismiss 17 filed by Bahash & Company LLC, Casite Intraco LLC, Executive Property Maintenance, Inc., Intraco Corporation Inc., Midwest Carwash Association, Signature Sotheby's International Realty, Inc., William A. Shortt, D.D.S. & Therese F. Shortt, D.D.S, P.C. (Attachments: # 1 Index, # 2 Exhibit 1, # 3 Exhibit 2, # 4 Exhibit 3, # 5 Exhibit 4) (ns) (Entered: 07/09/2020)
07/20/2020	27	MOTION for leave to file excess pages <i>/EXCEED WORD LIMIT</i> by defendants Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer; (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1: Defendants' Reply Brief in Support of Defendants' Motion to Dismiss, # 2 Exhibit 1 to Defendants' Reply Brief: Allen v. Whitmer, Order Denying Plaintiffs' Motion to Exclude Exhibits) (Fedynsky, John) (Entered: 07/20/2020)
07/31/2020	28	ORDER granting 27 motion for leave to file excess pages/exceed word limits; the Clerk of Court shall accept the proposed document for filing; signed by District Judge Paul L. Maloney (Judge Paul L. Maloney, acr) (Entered: 07/31/2020)
07/31/2020	29	REPLY to response to motion 17 filed by Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1) (ns) (Entered: 08/03/2020)

09/29/2020	30	MOTION to withdraw as attorney <i>Raymond P. Tolentino</i> by movant Michigan Epidemiologists; (Tolentino, Raymond) (Entered: 09/29/2020)
11/12/2020	31	STATUS REPORT ORDER; status report due by 12/1/2020 ; signed by District Judge Paul L. Maloney (Judge Paul L. Maloney, cmc) (Entered: 11/12/2020)
12/01/2020	32	JOINT STATUS REPORT submitted for filing by defendants Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer (Fedynsky, John) (Entered: 12/01/2020)
12/01/2020	33	PROPOSED STIPULATION and ORDER <i>Dismissing Case Without Prejudice and Without Costs</i> by defendants Robert Gordon, Gretchen E. Whitmer (Fedynsky, John) (Entered: 12/01/2020)
12/02/2020	34	STIPULATION AND ORDER of dismissal; signed by District Judge Paul L. Maloney (Judge Paul L. Maloney, acr) (Entered: 12/02/2020)

PACER Service Center			
Transaction Receipt			
12/07/2021 11:04:29			
PACER Login:	CRCClearinghouse	Client Code:	Kierum
Description:	Docket Report	Search Criteria:	1:20-cv-00360-PLM-PJG
Billable Pages:	8	Cost:	0.80
Exempt flag:	Not Exempt	Exempt reason:	Not Exempt