

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:17-cv-09447-JPO**

Richardson et al v. City of New York
Assigned to: Judge J. Paul Oetken
Cause: 42:1981ra Race Discrimination

Date Filed: 12/01/2017
Jury Demand: Defendant
Nature of Suit: 442 Civil Rights:
Jobs
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Annette Richardson
*on behalf of themselves and all
others similarly situated*

represented by **Aisha Rich**
Mehri & Skalet PLLC
1250 Connecticut Ave, NW Suite
300
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20036
202-822-5100
Email: arich@findjustice.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ezra Bronstein
Mehri & Skalet, PLLC
1250 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.,
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20036
202-822-5100
Fax: 202-822-4997
Email: ebronstein@findjustice.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lauren Nussbaum
Mehri & Skalet, PLLC
1250 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.,
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20036
202-822-5100
Fax: 202-822-4997
Email: lnussbaum@findjustice.com
TERMINATED: 09/10/2020

Matthew L. Berman

Valli Kane & Vagnini, LLP
600 Old Country Rd., Ste. 519
Garden City, NY 11530
(516)-203-7180
Fax: (516)-706-0248
Email: mberman@vkvlawyers.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Lieder

Mehri & Skalet, PLLC
1250 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.,
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20036
(202)-822-5100
Email: mlieder@findjustice.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert John Valli , Jr

Valli Kane & Vagnini, LLP
600 Old Country Rd., Ste. 519
Garden City, NY 11530
516-203-7180
Fax: 516-706-0248
Email: rvalli@vkvlawyers.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sara Wyn Kane

Valli Kane & Vagnini, LLP
600 Old Country Rd., Ste. 519
Garden City, NY 11530
(516) 203-7180
Fax: (516) 706-0248
Email: skane@vkvlawyers.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Deborah Bowman

*on behalf of themselves and all
others similarly situated*

represented by **Aisha Rich**

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ezra Bronstein

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lauren Nussbaum
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/10/2020

Matthew L. Berman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Lieder
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert John Valli , Jr
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sara Wyn Kane
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Liza Horsley
*on behalf of themselves and all
others similarly situated*
TERMINATED: 04/26/2019

represented by **Aisha Rich**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ezra Bronstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Matthew L. Berman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Lieder
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert John Valli , Jr
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sara Wyn Kane
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Debra Poe
*on behalf of themselves and all
others similarly situated*

represented by **Aisha Rich**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ezra Bronstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lauren Nussbaum
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/10/2020

Matthew L. Berman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Lieder
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert John Valli , Jr
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sara Wyn Kane
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Dino Riojas
*on behalf of themselves and all
others similarly situated*

represented by **Aisha Rich**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ezra Bronstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lauren Nussbaum
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/10/2020

Matthew L. Berman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Lieder

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert John Valli , Jr
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sara Wyn Kane
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Arlene Simmons
*on behalf of themselves and all
others similarly situated*
TERMINATED: 01/09/2018

represented by **Aisha Rich**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ezra Bronstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Matthew L. Berman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Lieder
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert John Valli , Jr
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sara Wyn Kane
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Stephanie Thomas
*on behalf of themselves and all
others similarly situated*

represented by **Aisha Rich**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ezra Bronstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lauren Nussbaum
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/10/2020

Matthew L. Berman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Lieder
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert John Valli , Jr
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sara Wyn Kane
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Jon Watson

represented by **Aisha Rich**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ezra Bronstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lauren Nussbaum
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/10/2020

Michael Lieder
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Brenda McKiver

represented by **Aisha Rich**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ezra Bronstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lauren Nussbaum
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/10/2020

Michael Lieder
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Erica Richardson

represented by **Aisha Rich**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ezra Bronstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lauren Nussbaum
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/10/2020

Michael Lieder
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

City of New York

represented by **Yuval Rubinstein**
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
(212)-788-8682
Fax: (212)-341-3934
Email: yrubinst@law.nyc.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
12/01/2017	<u>1</u>	FILING ERROR - DEFICIENT PLEADING - SIGNATURE ERROR - COMPLAINT against City of New York. (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number 0208-14426682)Document filed by Arlene

		Simmons, Annette Richardson, Debra Poe, Liza Horsley, Stephanie Thomas, Deborah Bowman, Dino Riojas.(Kane, Sara) Modified on 12/4/2017 (sj). (Entered: 12/01/2017)
12/01/2017	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Kane, Sara) (Entered: 12/01/2017)
12/01/2017	<u>3</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Robert John Valli, Jr on behalf of Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas. (Valli, Robert) (Entered: 12/01/2017)
12/01/2017		***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT PLEADING. Notice to Attorney Sara Wyn Kane to RE-FILE Document No. <u>1</u> Complaint. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): the pleading was not signed. Re-file the pleading using the event type Complaint found under the event list Complaints and Other Initiating Documents - attach the correct signed PDF - select the individually named filer/filers - select the individually named party/parties the pleading is against. (sj) (Entered: 12/04/2017)
12/01/2017		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above-entitled action is assigned to Judge J. Paul Oetken. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php . (sj) (Entered: 12/04/2017)
12/01/2017		Magistrate Judge Barbara C. Moses is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php . (sj) (Entered: 12/04/2017)
12/01/2017		Case Designated ECF. (sj) (Entered: 12/04/2017)
12/04/2017	<u>4</u>	COMPLAINT against City of New York. Document filed by Arlene Simmons, Annette Richardson, Debra Poe, Liza Horsley, Stephanie Thomas, Deborah Bowman, Dino Riojas.(Kane, Sara) (Entered: 12/04/2017)
12/22/2017	<u>5</u>	FILING ERROR - ELECTRONIC FILING OF NON-ECF DOCUMENT - NOTICE OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL Pursuant to Rule 41(a)(1)(A)(i) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, the

		plaintiff(s) and or their counsel(s), hereby give notice that the above-captioned action is voluntarily dismissed, without prejudice against the defendant(s) City of New York. Document filed by Arlene Simmons. (Kane, Sara) Modified on 12/26/2017 (dt). (Entered: 12/22/2017)
12/26/2017		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT - NON-ECF DOCUMENT ERROR. Note to Attorney Sara Kane to E-MAIL Document No. <u>5</u> Notice of Voluntary Dismissal to judgments@nysd.uscourts.gov This document is not filed via ECF. (dt) (Entered: 12/26/2017)
12/28/2017	<u>6</u>	MOTION for Michael Lieder to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-14522565. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Affidavit for Application, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>3</u> Proposed Order)(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 12/28/2017)
12/29/2017		>>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>6</u> MOTION for Michael Lieder to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-14522565. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (wb) (Entered: 12/29/2017)
01/09/2018	<u>7</u>	NOTICE OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL PURSUANT TO F.R.C.P. 41(a)(1)(A)(i): Pursuant to F.R.C.P. 41(a)(1)(A)(i), Plaintiff ARLENE SIMMONS hereby voluntarily dismisses all claims in this action without prejudice as to Defendant City of New York. Arlene Simmons (on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated) terminated. (Signed by Judge J. Paul Oetken on 1/9/2018) (ap) (Entered: 01/09/2018)
01/09/2018	<u>8</u>	WAIVER OF SERVICE RETURNED EXECUTED. City of New York waiver sent on 12/7/2017, answer due 2/5/2018. Document filed by Annette Richardson; Debra Poe; Liza Horsley; Stephanie Thomas; Deborah Bowman; Dino Riojas. (Kane, Sara) (Entered: 01/09/2018)
01/12/2018	9	ORDER granting <u>6</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice. GRANTED (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (Oetken, J.) (Entered: 01/12/2018)
02/05/2018	<u>10</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Yuval Rubinstein on behalf of City of New York. (Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 02/05/2018)

02/05/2018	<u>11</u>	MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint.</i> , MOTION to Stay re: <u>4</u> Complaint <i>Stay Discovery.</i> Document filed by City of New York.(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 02/05/2018)
02/05/2018	<u>12</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>11</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint.</i> MOTION to Stay re: <u>4</u> Complaint <i>Stay Discovery.</i> . Document filed by City of New York. (Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 02/05/2018)
02/05/2018	<u>13</u>	DECLARATION of Yuval Rubinstein in Support re: <u>11</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint.</i> MOTION to Stay re: <u>4</u> Complaint <i>Stay Discovery.</i> .. Document filed by City of New York. (Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 02/05/2018)
02/19/2018	<u>14</u>	FILING ERROR - ELECTRONIC FILING OF NON-ECF DOCUMENT - CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>13</u> Declaration in Support of Motion, <u>11</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint.</i> MOTION to Stay re: <u>4</u> Complaint <i>Stay Discovery.</i> , <u>12</u> Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Robert J. Valli, Jr. and Yuval Rubinstein dated 2/16/2018. Document filed by Annette Richardson. Return Date set for 3/5/2018 at 11:59 PM.(Valli, Robert) Modified on 4/17/2018 (db). (Entered: 02/19/2018)
02/20/2018	15	ORDER granting <u>14</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply. GRANTED. PLAINTIFFS SHALL FILE THEIR OPPOSITION OR OTHERWISE RESPOND TO DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO DISMISS ON OR BEFORE MARCH 5, 2018. SO ORDERED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (Oetken, J.) (Entered: 02/20/2018)
02/21/2018	<u>16</u>	MOTION for Cyrus Mehri to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-14725276. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of Cyrus Mehri in Support of Motion to Admit Counsel Pro Hac Vice, # <u>2</u> Connecticut Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>3</u> District of Columbia Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>4</u> Text of Proposed Order for Admission Pro Hac Vice)(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 02/21/2018)
02/21/2018		>>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>16</u> MOTION for Cyrus Mehri to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-14725276. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (bcu) (Entered: 02/21/2018)

03/05/2018	<u>17</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>11</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint</i> . MOTION to Stay re: <u>4</u> Complaint <i>Stay Discovery</i> . . Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibit A)(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 03/05/2018)
03/07/2018	<u>18</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>11</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint</i> . MOTION to Stay re: <u>4</u> Complaint <i>Stay Discovery</i> . addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Yuval Rubinstein dated March 7, 2018. Document filed by City of New York.(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 03/07/2018)
03/08/2018	19	ORDER granting <u>18</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply. GRANTED. DEFENDANT SHALL FILE ITS REPLY MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF ITS MOTION TO DISMISS ON OR BEFORE MARCH 20,2018. SO ORDERED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (Oetken, J.) (Entered: 03/08/2018)
03/12/2018	20	ORDER granting <u>16</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice. GRANTED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (Oetken, J.) (Entered: 03/12/2018)
03/20/2018	<u>21</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>11</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint</i> . MOTION to Stay re: <u>4</u> Complaint <i>Stay Discovery</i> . . Document filed by City of New York. (Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 03/20/2018)
04/16/2018	<u>22</u>	LETTER MOTION to Stay <i>Rule 26(f) Conference and Civil Case Management Plan and Scheduling Order</i> addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Yuval Rubinstein dated April 16, 2018. Document filed by City of New York.(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 04/16/2018)
04/17/2018	<u>23</u>	LETTER RESPONSE to Motion addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael D. Lieder dated April 17, 2018 re: <u>22</u> LETTER MOTION to Stay <i>Rule 26(f) Conference and Civil Case Management Plan and Scheduling Order</i> addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Yuval Rubinstein dated April 16, 2018. . Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas. (Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 04/17/2018)
04/17/2018	24	ORDER granting <u>22</u> Letter Motion to Stay. GRANTED. DISCOVERY IS STAYED PENDING RESOLUTION OF DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO DISMISS. SO ORDERED. (HEREBY ORDERED by

		Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (Oetken, J.) (Entered: 04/17/2018)
05/08/2018	25	NOTICE of Recent Authority re: 11 MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint</i> . MOTION to Stay re: 4 Complaint <i>Stay Discovery</i> .. Document filed by City of New York. (Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 05/08/2018)
09/28/2018	26	OPINION AND ORDER re: 11 MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint</i> MOTION to Stay re: 4 Complaint <i>Stay Discovery</i> filed by City of New York. For the foregoing reasons, the City's motion to stay discovery is DENIED as moot, Plaintiffs' claims are DISMISSED as moot to the extent they allege discrimination against EMS employees, and the City's motion to dismiss is GRANTED as to Plaintiffs' Section 1981 and NYCHRL claims insofar as they allege pay discrimination and as to all federal claims accruing prior to December 1, 2014. The City's motion to dismiss, however, is DENIED as to (1) Plaintiffs' Section 1981 claims accruing after December 1, 2014, insofar as they allege a pattern or practice of intentional discrimination in hiring and job placement; (2) Plaintiffs' NYCHRL claims insofar as they allege a pattern or practice of intentional discrimination in hiring and job placement; (3) and Plaintiffs' NYCHRL claims insofar as they allege that the City's hiring and job-placement practices have a disparate impact on African Americans. The Clerk of Court is directed to close the motion at Docket Number 11. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge J. Paul Oetken on 9/28/2018) (anc) Modified on 10/1/2018 (anc). (Entered: 09/28/2018)
10/09/2018	27	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer re: 4 Complaint addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Yuval Rubinstein dated October 9, 2018. Document filed by City of New York.(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 10/09/2018)
10/09/2018	28	ORDER granting 27 Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Answer. GRANTED. DEFENDANT SHALL ANSWER OR OTHERWISE RESPOND TO THE COMPLAINT ON OR BEFORE OCTOBER 26, 2018. SO ORDERED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (bh) (Entered: 10/09/2018)
10/26/2018	29	ANSWER to 4 Complaint with JURY DEMAND. Document filed by City of New York.(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 10/26/2018)
10/29/2018	30	ORDER: Counsel for all parties are directed to appear for an initial pretrial conference with the Court on November 15, 2018, at 12:00 p.m. The conference will be held in Courtroom 706 of the Thurgood Marshall United States Court House, 40 Foley Square, New York, New York. Counsel who appear at the pretrial conference must be authorized

		to negotiate terms of settlement. And as set forth herein. SO ORDERED. Initial Conference set for 11/15/2018 at 12:00 PM in Courtroom 706, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge J. Paul Oetken. (Signed by Judge J. Paul Oetken on 10/29/2018) (ama) (Entered: 10/29/2018)
10/29/2018	31	ORDER OF AUTOMATIC REFERRAL TO MEDIATION (See M-10-468 Second Amended Standing Order). Please reference the Pilot Discovery Protocols, attached, and the Mediation Program Procedures (http://nysd.uscourts.gov/mediation). E-mail MediationOffice@nysd.uscourts.gov, telephone 212-805-0643. Mediator to be Assigned by 11/8/2018. (Signed by Judge Loretta A. Preska on 10/1/2015) (mf) (Entered: 10/29/2018)
11/12/2018	32	PROPOSED CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Protective Order) (Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 11/12/2018)
11/13/2018	33	LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Amended Complaint addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael Lieder dated November 13, 2018. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Exhibit A)(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 11/13/2018)
11/15/2018	34	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Matthew L. Berman on behalf of Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas. (Berman, Matthew) (Entered: 11/15/2018)
11/15/2018		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge J. Paul Oetken: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 11/15/2018. Next conference scheduled for 1/10/2019 at 3:00 pm. (bh) (Entered: 11/15/2018)
11/15/2018	35	PROTECTIVE ORDER:...regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material. And as set forth herein. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge J. Paul Oetken on 11/15/2018) (ama) (Entered: 11/15/2018)
11/21/2018	36	LETTER RESPONSE in Opposition to Motion addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Yuval Rubinstein dated November 21, 2018 re: 33 LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Amended Complaint addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael Lieder dated November 13, 2018. . Document filed by City of New York. (Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 11/21/2018)

11/27/2018	37	CIVIL CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN: All parties do not consent to conducting all further proceedings before a United States Magistrate Judge, including motions and trial. 28 U.S.C. § 636(c). Fact Discovery due by 7/15/2019. Plaintiffs' reply will be filed no later than 15 days after the filing of defendant's opposition. Case Management Conference set for 1/10/2019 at 03:00 PM before Judge J. Paul Oetken, and as further set forth in this Civil Case Management Plan. So ordered. (Signed by Judge J. Paul Oetken on 11/15/2018) (rjm) (Entered: 11/27/2018)
11/28/2018	38	LETTER REPLY to Response to Motion addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael Lieder dated November 27, 2018 re: 33 LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Amended Complaint addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael Lieder dated November 13, 2018. . Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas. (Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 11/28/2018)
12/03/2018		NOTICE OF MEDIATOR ASSIGNMENT - Notice of assignment of mediator. Mediator Schedule due by 1/2/2019.(mf) (Entered: 12/03/2018)
01/02/2019	39	JOINT LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>Scheduled For January 10, 2019</i> addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Yuval Rubinstein dated January 2, 2019. Document filed by City of New York.(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 01/02/2019)
01/02/2019	40	ORDER granting 39 Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference. GRANTED. THE CONFERENCE CURRENTLY SCHEDULED FOR JANUARY 10, 2019, IS ADJOURNED TO MARCH 11, 2019, AT 3:00 PM. SO ORDERED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (bh) (Entered: 01/02/2019)
01/23/2019	41	FILING ERROR - WRONG EVENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU - LETTER MOTION for Conference addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael Lieder dated January 23, 2019. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas.(Lieder, Michael) Modified on 2/7/2019 (db). (Entered: 01/23/2019)
01/24/2019	42	ORDER granting 41 Letter Motion for Conference. GRANTED. THE DOCKET SHALL REFLECT THE PARTIES' AGREEMENT TO MAKE USE OF THIS COURT'S MEDIATION PROGRAM. SO ORDERED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (bh) (Entered: 01/24/2019)

01/24/2019	43	PROPOSED CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN. Document filed by City of New York. (Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 01/24/2019)
02/14/2019		MEDIATOR SESSION SCHEDULED First Mediation Session scheduled for 4/16/19, 9:30 A.M. at 40 Foley Square.(ah) (Entered: 02/14/2019)
03/01/2019	44	LETTER MOTION for Discovery <i>Disputes</i> addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael D. Lieder dated March 1, 2019. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C, # 4 Exhibit D)(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 03/01/2019)
03/04/2019	45	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to 44 LETTER MOTION for Discovery <i>Disputes</i> addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael D. Lieder dated March 1, 2019. <i>From March 5, 2019 to March 7, 2019</i> addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Yuval Rubinstein dated March 4, 2019. Document filed by City of New York.(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 03/04/2019)
03/05/2019	46	ORDER granting 45 Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply. GRANTED. DEFENDANT'S RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFFS' LETTER OF MARCH 1, 2019, SHALL BE DUE ON OR BEFORE MARCH 7, 2019. SO ORDERED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (bh) (Entered: 03/05/2019)
03/06/2019	47	LETTER RESPONSE to Motion addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Yuval Rubinstein dated March 6, 2019 re: 44 LETTER MOTION for Discovery <i>Disputes</i> addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael D. Lieder dated March 1, 2019. . Document filed by City of New York. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1, # 2 Exhibit 2)(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 03/06/2019)
03/11/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge J. Paul Oetken: Pretrial Conference held on 3/11/2019. (bh) (Entered: 03/13/2019)
03/12/2019	48	ORDER granting in part and denying in part 44 Letter Motion for Discovery. As stated on the record during the March 11, 2019 status conference, Plaintiffs' request that the Court order Defendant to produce certain demographic information in connection with Plaintiffs' Document Production Request No. 3 is GRANTED IN PART and DENIED IN PART and Plaintiffs' request that the Court order Defendant to respond to specified Requests for Admission is DENIED. The Clerk is directed to close the motion at Docket Number 44. SO

		ORDERED. (Signed by Judge J. Paul Oetken on 3/11/2019) (ne) (Entered: 03/12/2019)
04/08/2019	49	OPINION AND ORDER: re: 33 LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Amended Complaint addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael Lieder dated November 13, 2018. filed by Debra Poe, Arlene Simmons, Dino Riojas, Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Stephanie Thomas, Annette Richardson. For the foregoing reasons, Plaintiffs' motion for leave to amend is GRANTED. Plaintiffs shall file their amended complaint on or before April 22, 2019. The City is directed to answer or otherwise respond to the amended complaint within three weeks after it is filed. The Clerk of Court is directed to close the motion at Docket Number 33. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge J. Paul Oetken on 4/8/2019) (js) (Entered: 04/08/2019)
04/08/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: Amended Pleadings due by 4/22/2019. (js) (Entered: 04/08/2019)
04/09/2019	50	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: conference held on 3/11/2019 before Judge J. Paul Oetken. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Vincent Bologna, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/30/2019. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 5/10/2019. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 7/8/2019.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/09/2019)
04/09/2019	51	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a conference proceeding held on 3/11/19 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/09/2019)
04/17/2019		MEDIATOR SESSION NOT HELD Mediator Session scheduled for 4/16/2019 at 40 Foley Square was NOT held.(mf) (Entered: 04/18/2019)
04/18/2019		MEDIATOR SESSION SCHEDULED First Mediation Session scheduled for 5/21/2019 at 10:00AM at the 40 Foley Square Courthouse (40 Centre Street).(mf) (Entered: 04/18/2019)
04/18/2019		MEDIATOR SESSION SCHEDULED First Mediation Session scheduled for 5/22/2019 at 10:00AM at the 40 Foley Square

		Courthouse (40 Centre Street).(mf) Modified on 4/24/2019 (mf). (Entered: 04/18/2019)
04/22/2019	52	FILING ERROR - DEFICIENT PLEADING - FILED AGAINST PARTY ERROR -FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT amending 4 Complaint against City of New York.Document filed by Arlene Simmons, Annette Richardson, Debra Poe, Liza Horsley, Stephanie Thomas, Deborah Bowman, Dino Riojas. Related document: 4 Complaint.(Lieder, Michael) Modified on 4/23/2019 (pne). (Entered: 04/22/2019)
04/23/2019		***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT PLEADING. Notice to Attorney Michael Lieder to RE-FILE re: Document No. 52 Amended Complaint,. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): all of the parties listed on the pleading were not entered on CM ECF; the wrong party/parties whom the pleading is against were selected; Jon Watson, Brenda McKiver, and Erica Richardson must be added to the case; the Amended Complaint was filed incorrectly on the due date, therefore Court's leave will be required to re-file the pleading. Docket the event type Add Party to Pleading found under the event list Complaints and Other Initiating Documents.. Re-file the pleading using the event type Amended Complaint found under the event list Complaints and Other Initiating Documents - attach the correct signed PDF - select the individually named filer/filers - select the individually named party/parties the pleading is against. File the Exhibit to Pleading event found under the event list Other Documents and attach either opposing party's written consent or Court's leave. (pne) (Entered: 04/23/2019)
04/24/2019		MEDIATOR SESSION NOT HELD Mediator Session scheduled for 5/21/2019 at 40 Foley Square will NOT be held.(mf) (Entered: 04/24/2019)
04/24/2019	53	LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Amended Complaint addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael Lieder dated 04-24-2019. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Dino Riojas, Stephanie Thomas.(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 04/24/2019)
04/24/2019	54	ORDER granting 53 Letter Motion for Leave to File DocumentGRANTED. PLAINTIFFS HAVE THE COURT'S LEAVE TO RE-FILE THEIR AMENDED COMPLAINT ON OR BEFORE MAY 1, 2019. SO ORDERED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (Sansone, Nicolas) (Entered: 04/24/2019)

04/25/2019	55	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT amending 52 Amended Complaint, 4 Complaint against City of New York.Document filed by Stephanie Thomas, Deborah Bowman, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Dino Riojas, Jon Watson, Brenda McKiver, Erica Richardson. Related document: 52 Amended Complaint, 4 Complaint. (Attachments: # 1 Supplement Order Granting Leave)(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 04/25/2019)
05/13/2019	56	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer re: 55 Amended Complaint, addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Yuval Rubinstein dated May 13, 2019. Document filed by City of New York.(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 05/13/2019)
05/13/2019	57	ORDER granting 56 Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Answer City of New York answer due 5/24/2019. GRANTED. DEFENDANT SHALL FILE ITS AMENDED ANSWER ON OR BEFORE MAY 24, 2019. SO ORDERED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (bh) (Entered: 05/13/2019)
05/23/2019		Mediator Session Held on 5/22/19 at 40 Foley Square.(ah) (Entered: 05/23/2019)
05/23/2019		MEDIATOR SESSION SCHEDULED Mediation Session scheduled for 6/17/19, 9:30 AM at 40 Foley Square.(ah) (Entered: 05/23/2019)
05/24/2019	58	ANSWER to 55 Amended Complaint, with JURY DEMAND. Document filed by City of New York.(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 05/24/2019)
06/13/2019		MEDIATOR SESSION NOT HELD Mediator Session scheduled for 6/17/19 at 40 Foley Square will NOT be held.(ah) (Entered: 06/13/2019)
06/13/2019		MEDIATOR SESSION SCHEDULED Mediation Session re-scheduled for 10/28/19, 10 AM at 40 Foley Square.(ah) (Entered: 06/13/2019)
06/25/2019	59	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael D. Lieder dated June 25, 2019. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas, Jon Watson. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B)(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 06/25/2019)
06/26/2019	60	AMENDED CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN; granting 59 Letter Motion for Extension of Time. All parties do not consent to conducting all further proceedings before a United States Magistrate Judge, including motions and trial. 28 U.S.C. § 636(c). The parties are free to

		withhold consent without adverse substantive consequences. The parties have conferred pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(f). Amended pleadings may not be filed and additional parties may not be joined except with leave of the Court. Any motion to amend or to join additional parties shall be filed within 60 days from the date of this Order. Depositions shall be completed by November 15, 2019. All counsel must meet in person to resume their settlement discussions no later than November 27, 2019. The proposed amended case management plan is approved. Counsel for the parties shall appear for a pretrial conference in Courtroom 706 of the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Foley Square, New York, NY 10007, on November 25, 2019, at 11:00 AM. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge J. Paul Oetken on 6/26/2019) (js) Modified on 6/26/2019 (js). (Entered: 06/26/2019)
06/26/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: (Deposition due by 3/13/2020. Fact Discovery due by 11/15/2019. Motions due by 4/13/2020.), Set/Reset Hearings:(Pretrial Conference set for 11/25/2019 at 11:00 AM in Courtroom 706, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge J. Paul Oetken.) (js) (Entered: 06/26/2019)
07/17/2019	61	MOTION for Lauren Michelle Nussbaum to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-17261426. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Stephanie Thomas, Jon Watson. (Attachments: # 1 Affidavit, # 2 Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing DC, # 3 Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing MD, # 4 Exhibit Proposed Order)(Nussbaum, Lauren) (Entered: 07/17/2019)
07/17/2019		>>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. 61 MOTION for Lauren Michelle Nussbaum to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-17261426. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (bcu) (Entered: 07/17/2019)
07/23/2019	62	ORDER granting 61 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice. GRANTED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (bh) (Entered: 07/23/2019)
09/18/2019	63	FIRST MOTION for Chaim Ezra Bronstein to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-17620749. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas, Jon Watson. (Attachments: # 1 Affidavit, # 2 Text

		of Proposed Order, # 3 Exhibit, # 4 Exhibit)(Bronstein, Ezra) (Entered: 09/18/2019)
09/18/2019		>>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. 63 FIRST MOTION for Chaim Ezra Bronstein to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-17620749. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (wb) (Entered: 09/18/2019)
09/25/2019	64	ORDER granting 63 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice. GRANTED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (bh) (Entered: 09/25/2019)
10/31/2019		MEDIATION CONFERENCE NOT HELD Mediation Conference scheduled for 10/28/19 at Thurgood Marshall U.S. Courthouse 40 Foley Square New York NY 10007 was not held. Mediation Status due by 11/12/2019.(smc) (Entered: 10/31/2019)
11/13/2019	65	SECOND LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael D. Lieder dated November 13, 2019. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Stephanie Thomas, Jon Watson. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit Exhibit B)(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 11/13/2019)
11/14/2019	66	SECOND AMENDED CIVIL CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN. All parties do not consent to conducting all further proceedings before a United States Magistrate Judge, including motions and trial. 28 U.S.C. § 636(c). All fact discovery shall be completed no later than December 20, 2019. Depositions shall be completed by December 20, 2019. All expert depositions shall be completed by April 24, 2020. Motion for class certification will be filed no later than May 26, 2020; defendant's opposition will be filed no later than 30 days after the filing of plaintiffs' motion; and plaintiffs' reply will be filed no later than 15 days after the filing of defendant's opposition. The conference previously scheduled for November 25, 2019, is hereby adjourned to January 17, 2020, at 12:00 pm., and as further specified and set forth in this Second Amended Civil Case Management Plan. So ordered. Granting 65 SECOND LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael D. Lieder dated November 13, 2019. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Stephanie Thomas, Jon Watson. (Deposition due by

		4/24/2020. Motions due by 5/26/2020). (Signed by Judge J. Paul Oetken on 11/14/2019) (rjm) (Entered: 11/14/2019)
11/14/2019		Set/Reset Deadlines: (Fact Discovery due by 12/20/2019.) Set/Reset Hearings: (Pretrial Conference set for 1/17/2020 at 12:00 PM before Judge J. Paul Oetken.) (rjm) (Entered: 11/14/2019)
01/07/2020	67	CONSENT LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>Scheduled For January 17, 2020</i> addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Yuval Rubinstein dated January 7, 2020. Document filed by City of New York.(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 01/07/2020)
01/08/2020	68	ORDER granting 67 Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference. GRANTED. THE PRETRIAL CONFERENCE CURRENTLY SCHEDULED FOR JANUARY 17, 2020, IS HEREBY ADJOURNED TO JANUARY 23, 2020, AT 10:45 A.M. SO ORDERED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (Park, Isaac) (Entered: 01/08/2020)
01/23/2020		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge J. Paul Oetken: Pretrial Conference held on 1/23/2020. (bh) (Entered: 01/23/2020)
01/29/2020		MEDIATION CONFERENCE Mediation Conference scheduled for 4/7/2020 at 10:00 AM in Thurgood Marshall U.S. Courthouse, 40 Foley Square, New York, NY 10007.(ah) (Entered: 01/29/2020)
01/30/2020	69	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael D. Lieder dated January 30, 2020. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas, Jon Watson.(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 01/30/2020)
02/04/2020	70	ORDER granting 69 LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael D. Lieder dated January 30, 2020. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas, Jon Watson. Granted. The extensions are so ordered, with the exception of the erroneous expert deposition deadline, which is instead extended to May 1, 2020. (Deposition due by 5/1/2020). (Signed by Judge J. Paul Oetken on 2/4/2020) (rjm) (Entered: 02/04/2020)
02/05/2020		MEDIATION CONFERENCE NOT HELD Mediation Conference scheduled for 4/7/2020 at Thurgood Marshall U.S. Courthouse 40 Foley Square New York NY 10007 was not held.(ah) (Entered: 02/05/2020)

02/05/2020		MEDIATION CONFERENCE Mediation Conference scheduled for 4/28/2020 at 10:00 AM in Thurgood Marshall U.S. Courthouse, 40 Foley Square, New York, NY 10007.(ah) (Entered: 02/05/2020)
04/07/2020	71	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael D. Lieder dated April 7, 2020. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas, Jon Watson..(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 04/07/2020)
04/08/2020	72	ORDER granting 71 Letter Motion for Extension of Time. GRANTED. AS RECOMMENDED BY COUNSEL, THE IN-PERSON MEDIATION PROCESS SHALL RESUME ON OR BEFORE JUNE 30, 2020. IF, HOWEVER, THE PARTIES CONCLUDE THAT THE CORONAVIRUS EMERGENCY MAKES THE RESUMPTION OF THE MEDIATION INFEASIBLE BY THAT DATE, THEY SHALL NOTIFY THE COURT NO LATER THAN JUNE 23, 2020, OF THE NEW DEADLINE FOR THE MEDIATION THAT THEY RECOMMEND. THEY ALSO WILL REPORT TO THE COURT EVERY THIRTY DAYS OF THEIR PROGRESS ON MEDIATION UNTIL ANOTHER MEDIATION SESSION HAS OCCURRED. SO ORDERED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (Park, Isaac) (Entered: 04/08/2020)
05/14/2020		MEDIATION CONFERENCE NOT HELD Mediation Conference scheduled for 04/28/2020 at Thurgood Marshall U.S. Courthouse 40 Foley Square New York NY 10007 was not held. Mediation Status due by 6/15/2020..(rpr) (Entered: 05/14/2020)
05/20/2020	73	LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael D. Lieder dated 05/20/2020. Document filed by Dino Riojas. Return Date set for 5/22/2020 at 08:00 AM..(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 05/20/2020)
05/21/2020		MEDIATION CONFERENCE RE-SCHEDULED Re-scheduled Mediation Conference scheduled for 6/30/2020 at 10:00 AM format/location pending..(rpr) (Entered: 05/21/2020)
05/21/2020	74	ORDER granting 73 Letter Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. GRANTED. THE PARTIES SHALL FILE OPENING BRIEFS OF NO LONGER THAN FORTY PAGES. PLAINTIFF SHALL FILE A REPLY BRIEF OF NO LONGER THAN FIFTEEN PAGES. SO ORDERED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (Park, Isaac) (Entered: 05/21/2020)

05/26/2020	75	MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Partially as to Plaintiffs Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Debra Poe, Dino Riojas, and Stephanie Thomas.</i> , MOTION to Strike Document No. 55 <i>Amended Complaint's Disparate Impact Class Allegations.</i> Document filed by City of New York..(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 05/26/2020)
05/26/2020	76	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 75 MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Partially as to Plaintiffs Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Debra Poe, Dino Riojas, and Stephanie Thomas.</i> MOTION to Strike Document No. 55 <i>Amended Complaint's Disparate Impact Class Allegations.</i> . Document filed by City of New York..(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 05/26/2020)
05/26/2020	77	RULE 56.1 STATEMENT. Document filed by City of New York..(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 05/26/2020)
05/26/2020	78	DECLARATION of Yuval Rubinstein in Support re: 75 MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Partially as to Plaintiffs Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Debra Poe, Dino Riojas, and Stephanie Thomas.</i> MOTION to Strike Document No. 55 <i>Amended Complaint's Disparate Impact Class Allegations.</i> .. Document filed by City of New York. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C, # 4 Exhibit D, # 5 Exhibit E, # 6 Exhibit F, # 7 Exhibit G, # 8 Exhibit H).(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 05/26/2020)
05/26/2020	79	MOTION to Certify Class . Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas..(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 05/26/2020)
05/26/2020	80	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 79 MOTION to Certify Class . . Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit, # 2 Exhibit, # 3 Exhibit, # 4 Exhibit, # 5 Exhibit, # 6 Exhibit, # 7 Exhibit, # 8 Exhibit, # 9 Exhibit, # 10 Exhibit, # 11 Exhibit, # 12 Exhibit, # 13 Exhibit, # 14 Exhibit, # 15 Exhibit, # 16 Exhibit, # 17 Exhibit, # 18 Exhibit, # 19 Exhibit, # 20 Exhibit, # 21 Exhibit, # 22 Exhibit, # 23 Exhibit, # 24 Exhibit, # 25 Exhibit, # 26 Exhibit, # 27 Exhibit, # 28 Exhibit, # 29 Exhibit, # 30 Exhibit, # 31 Exhibit, # 32 Exhibit, # 33 Exhibit, # 34 Exhibit, # 35 Exhibit, # 36 Exhibit, # 37 Exhibit, # 38 Exhibit, # 39 Exhibit, # 40 Exhibit, # 41 Exhibit, # 42 Exhibit, # 43 Exhibit, # 44 Exhibit, # 45 Exhibit, # 46 Exhibit, # 47 Exhibit, # 48 Exhibit, # 49 Exhibit, # 50 Exhibit, # 51 Exhibit, # 52 Exhibit, # 53 Exhibit, # 54 Exhibit, # 55 Exhibit, # 56 Exhibit, # 57 Exhibit, # 58 Exhibit, # 59 Exhibit, # 60 Exhibit, # 61 Exhibit, # 62 Exhibit).(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 05/26/2020)

06/01/2020	81	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael D. Lieder dated 06/01/2020. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas..(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 06/01/2020)
06/03/2020	82	ORDER granting 81 Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply re 75 MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Partially as to Plaintiffs Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Debra Poe, Dino Riojas, and Stephanie Thomas</i> . MOTION to Strike Document No. 55 <i>Amended Complaint's Disparate Impact Class Allegations</i> . GRANTED. PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION TO ANY MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT SHALL BE FILED NO LATER THAN THIRTY DAYS AFTER THE FILING OF THAT MOTION. DEFENDANT'S REPLY SHALL BE FILED NO LATER THAN FIFTEEN DAYS AFTER THE FILING OF PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION. SO ORDERED. Responses due by 6/25/2020 (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (Park, Isaac) (Entered: 06/03/2020)
06/15/2020	83	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>To Postpone Mediation</i> addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael D. Lieder dated 06/15/2020. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas, Jon Watson..(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 06/15/2020)
06/22/2020	84	ORDER granting 83 Letter Motion for Extension of Time. GRANTED. THE IN-PERSON MEDIATION PROCESS SHALL RESUME NO LATER THAN FORTY-FIVE DAYS AFTER THE DISPOSITION OF THE PENDING MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION. SO ORDERED. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (Park, Isaac) (Entered: 06/22/2020)
06/25/2020	85	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 79 MOTION to Certify Class . . Document filed by City of New York..(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 06/25/2020)
06/25/2020	86	DECLARATION of Yuval Rubinstein in Opposition re: 79 MOTION to Certify Class .. Document filed by City of New York. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C, # 4 Exhibit D, # 5 Exhibit E, # 6 Exhibit F, # 7 Exhibit G, # 8 Exhibit H, # 9 Exhibit I, # 10 Exhibit J, # 11 Exhibit K, # 12 Exhibit L, # 13 Exhibit M, # 14 Exhibit N, # 15 Exhibit O, # 16 Exhibit P, # 17 Exhibit Q, # 18 Exhibit R, # 19 Exhibit S, # 20 Exhibit T, # 21 Exhibit U, # 22 Exhibit V, # 23 Exhibit W, # 24 Exhibit X, # 25 Exhibit Y, # 26 Exhibit Z, # 27 Exhibit AA, # 28 Exhibit AB, # 29 Exhibit AC, # 30 Exhibit AD, # 31 Exhibit AE, #

		32 Exhibit AF, # 33 Exhibit AG, # 34 Exhibit AH, # 35 Exhibit AI, # 36 Exhibit AJ).(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 06/25/2020)
06/25/2020	87	***SELECTED PARTIES*** BRIEF re: 86 Declaration in Opposition to Motion,,, <i>Exhibit U</i> . Document filed by City of New York, Deborah Bowman, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Stephanie Thomas, Jon Watson.Motion or Order to File Under Seal: 35 .(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 06/25/2020)
06/25/2020	88	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 75 MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Partially as to Plaintiffs Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Debra Poe, Dino Riojas, and Stephanie Thomas</i> . MOTION to Strike Document No. 55 <i>Amended Complaint's Disparate Impact Class Allegations</i> . . Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas. (Attachments: # 1 Index, # 2 Exhibit, # 3 Exhibit, # 4 Exhibit, # 5 Exhibit, # 6 Exhibit, # 7 Exhibit, # 8 Exhibit, # 9 Exhibit, # 10 Exhibit, # 11 Exhibit, # 12 Exhibit, # 13 Exhibit, # 14 Exhibit, # 15 Exhibit, # 16 Exhibit).(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 06/25/2020)
06/25/2020	89	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 75 MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Partially as to Plaintiffs Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Debra Poe, Dino Riojas, and Stephanie Thomas</i> . MOTION to Strike Document No. 55 <i>Amended Complaint's Disparate Impact Class Allegations</i> . . Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit, # 2 Exhibit, # 3 Exhibit, # 4 Errata, # 5 Exhibit, # 6 Exhibit, # 7 Exhibit, # 8 Exhibit, # 9 Exhibit, # 10 Exhibit, # 11 Exhibit, # 12 Exhibit, # 13 Exhibit, # 14 Exhibit, # 15 Exhibit, # 16 Exhibit).(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 06/25/2020)
06/25/2020	90	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 75 MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Partially as to Plaintiffs Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Debra Poe, Dino Riojas, and Stephanie Thomas</i> . MOTION to Strike Document No. 55 <i>Amended Complaint's Disparate Impact Class Allegations</i> . . Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons..(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 06/25/2020)
06/25/2020	91	RESPONSE in Opposition to Motion re: 75 MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Partially as to Plaintiffs Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Debra Poe, Dino Riojas, and Stephanie Thomas</i> .

		MOTION to Strike Document No. 55 <i>Amended Complaint's Disparate Impact Class Allegations</i> . . Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas..(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 06/25/2020)
07/01/2020	92	LETTER addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Yuval Rubinstein dated July 1, 2020 re: Number of Job Titles in Putative Class. Document filed by City of New York..(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 07/01/2020)
07/10/2020	93	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 79 MOTION to Certify Class . . Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Index, # 2 Exhibit, # 3 Exhibit, # 4 Exhibit, # 5 Exhibit, # 6 Exhibit, # 7 Exhibit, # 8 Exhibit, # 9 Exhibit, # 10 Exhibit, # 11 Exhibit, # 12 Exhibit, # 13 Exhibit).(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 07/10/2020)
07/10/2020	94	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 75 MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>Partially as to Plaintiffs Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Debra Poe, Dino Riojas, and Stephanie Thomas</i> . MOTION to Strike Document No. 55 <i>Amended Complaint's Disparate Impact Class Allegations</i> . . Document filed by City of New York..(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 07/10/2020)
07/10/2020	95	RULE 56.1 STATEMENT. Document filed by City of New York..(Rubinstein, Yuval) (Entered: 07/10/2020)
08/03/2020	96	MOTION for Aisha Rich to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-20966388. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas, Jon Watson..(Rich, Aisha) (Entered: 08/03/2020)
08/03/2020		>>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. 96 MOTION for Aisha Rich to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-20966388. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (bcu) (Entered: 08/03/2020)
08/04/2020	97	ORDER granting 96 Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice. GRANTD. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge J. Paul Oetken)(Text Only Order) (bh) (Entered: 08/04/2020)

08/04/2020		MEDIATION CONFERENCE NOT HELD Mediation Conference scheduled for 06/30/2020 at Counsel's Office was not held. Mediation Status due by 10/1/2020..(rpr) (Entered: 08/04/2020)
09/01/2020	98	LETTER addressed to Judge J. Paul Oetken from Michael Lieder dated 09/01/2020 re: Debra Poe Retirement. Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas, Jon Watson..(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 09/01/2020)
09/09/2020	99	MOTION to Withdraw <i>Appearance of Lauren Nussbaum</i> . Document filed by Deborah Bowman, Liza Horsley, Brenda McKiver, Debra Poe, Annette Richardson, Erica Richardson, Dino Riojas, Arlene Simmons, Stephanie Thomas, Jon Watson..(Lieder, Michael) (Entered: 09/09/2020)
09/10/2020	100	MEMO ENDORSEMENT granting 99 Motion to Withdraw Appearance. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered.*** Attorney Lauren Nussbaum terminated. (Signed by Judge J. Paul Oetken on 9/10/2020) (js) Modified on 9/10/2020 (js). (Entered: 09/10/2020)

PACER Service Center

Transaction Receipt

01/30/2021 11:33:19

PACER Login:	CRClearinghouse	Client Code:	Feng
Description:	Docket Report	Search Criteria:	1:17-cv-09447-JPO
Billable Pages:	20	Cost:	2.00