

CLOSED, LEAD

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:01-cv-04437-DC-MHD**

Wright, et al v. Stern, et al
Assigned to: Judge Denny Chin
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger
Demand: \$0
Member case: ([View Member Case](#))
Cause: 42:1981 Equal Rights Under the Law

Date Filed: 05/24/2001
Date Terminated: 05/15/2008
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 442 Civil Rights: Jobs
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Robert Wright

represented by **Cynthia Rollings**
Beldock, Levine & Hoffman, L.L.P.
99 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10016-1503
(212) 490-0400
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jody Lynn Yetzer
Beldock, Levine & Hoffman, L.L.P.
99 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10016
(212) 490-0400
LEAD ATTORNEY

Lewis M. Steel
Outten & Golden, LLP (NYC)
3 Park Avenue, 29th Floor
New York, NY 10016
(646) 825-9835
Fax: (212) 245-4005
Email: ls@outtengolden.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

Melissa S. Woods
Meyer, Suozzi, English & Klein, P.C.(NYC)
1350 Broadway, Suite 501
New York, NY 10018
(212)-239-4999
Fax: (212)-239-1311
Email: mwoods@msek.com
TERMINATED: 06/11/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Myron Beldock
Beldock Levine & Hoffman LLP
99 Park Ave (16 Fl.)
New York, NY 10016
212-490-0400
Fax: 212-557-0565
Email: mbeldock@blhny.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

Robert H. Stroup
Levy Ratner, P.C.
80 Eighth Avenue, Floor 8
New York, NY 10011
(212) 627-8100
Fax: (212) 627-8182
Email: rstroup@lrbpc.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven H. Goldman
Steven Goldman Attorney At Law
190 East 161 Street
Bronx, NY 10451
(718)-538-5743
Fax: (718)-410-0590
Email: criminallawyers@optonline.net
LEAD ATTORNEY

Matthew Colangelo
NAACP Legal Defense & Educational
Fund, Inc.
99 Hudson St., 16th floor
New York, NY 10013
212 965 2268
Fax: 212 226 7592
Email: mcolangelo@naacpldf.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Kathleen Walker

represented by **Cynthia Rollings**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jody Lynn Yetzer
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Lewis M. Steel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Melissa S. Woods
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/11/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Myron Beldock
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Robert H. Stroup
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven H. Goldman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Matthew Colangelo
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Henry Roman

represented by **Cynthia Rollings**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jody Lynn Yetzer
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Lewis M. Steel

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Melissa S. Woods
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/11/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Myron Beldock
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Robert H. Stroup
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven H. Goldman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Matthew Colangelo
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Elizabeth Rogers

represented by **Cynthia Rollings**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jody Lynn Yetzer
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Lewis M. Steel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Melissa S. Woods
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/11/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Myron Beldock
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Robert H. Stroup
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven H. Goldman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Matthew Colangelo
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

David Ray

represented by **Cynthia Rollings**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jody Lynn Yetzer

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Lewis M. Steel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Melissa S. Woods
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/11/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Myron Beldock
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Robert H. Stroup
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven H. Goldman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Matthew Colangelo
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Odessa Portlette

represented by **Cynthia Rollings**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jody Lynn Yetzer
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Lewis M. Steel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Melissa S. Woods
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/11/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Myron Beldock
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Robert H. Stroup
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven H. Goldman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Matthew Colangelo
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Paula Loving

represented by

Cynthia Rollings
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jody Lynn Yetzer
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Lewis M. Steel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Melissa S. Woods
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/11/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Myron Beldock
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Robert H. Stroup
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven H. Goldman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Matthew Colangelo
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Angelo Colon

represented by **Cynthia Rollings**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jody Lynn Yetzer
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Lewis M. Steel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Melissa S. Woods
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/11/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Myron Beldock
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Robert H. Stroup
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven H. Goldman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Matthew Colangelo

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Jacqueline Brown

represented by **Cynthia Rollings**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jody Lynn Yetzer
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Lewis M. Steel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Melissa S. Woods
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/11/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Myron Beldock
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Robert H. Stroup
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven H. Goldman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Matthew Colangelo
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Walter Beach

represented by **Cynthia Rollings**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jody Lynn Yetzer
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Lewis M. Steel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Melissa S. Woods
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/11/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Myron Beldock
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Robert H. Stroup
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven H. Goldman

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Matthew Colangelo
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Carrie Anderson
Individually and as Class Representatives

represented by **Cynthia Rollings**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jody Lynn Yetzer
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Lewis M. Steel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Melissa S. Woods
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/11/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Myron Beldock
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Robert H. Stroup
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven H. Goldman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Matthew Colangelo
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Henry J. Stern
*individually and in his official capacity as
Commissioner of the New York City
Department of Parks and Recreation*

represented by **Barbara B Butler**
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
(212) 788-0868
Fax: (212) 788-0367
Email: bbutler@law.nyc.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY

Kathleen Marie Comfrey
NYC Law Department, Office of the
Corporation Counsel(NYC)
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
212-848-4178
Fax: 646-848-4178
Email: kcomfrey@law.nyc.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Matthew Colangelo
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

**New York City Department of Parks
and Recreation**
TERMINATED: 08/06/2001

Defendant

The City of New York

represented by **Barbara B Butler**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Kathleen Marie Comfrey
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Adrian Benepe
*individually and in his official capacity as
Commissioner of the NYC Department of
Parks and Recreation*

represented by **Kathleen Marie Comfrey**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Matthew Colangelo
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Consolidated Defendant

**New York City Department of Parks
and Recreation**

represented by **Kathleen Marie Comfrey**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor Defendant

The City of New York

represented by **Barbara B Butler**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Kathleen Marie Comfrey
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor Defendant

**New York City Department of Parks
and Recreation**

represented by **Kathleen Marie Comfrey**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
05/24/2001	1	CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT filed. Summons issued and Notice pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 636(c). FILING FEE \$ 150.00 RECEIPT # 406970. (jco) (Entered: 05/25/2001)
05/24/2001		Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger is so designated. (jco) (Entered: 05/25/2001)
05/25/2001	2	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of summons and complaint as to The City of N.Y. c/o of the Corporation Counsel of the City of New York on 5/24/01. Answer due on 6/13/01 for The City of N.Y. (kw) (Entered: 05/30/2001)

05/25/2001	3	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of summons and complaint as to Henry J. Stern, and N.Y.C. Department by Dianne Caraballo on 5/24/01. Answer due on 6/13/01 for Henry J. Stern, for N.Y.C. Department. (kw) (Entered: 05/30/2001)
06/14/2001	4	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Chin from Barbara B. Butler, dated 6/13/01; the depts' time to answer or move is extended to a date to be set at the conference. (signed by Judge Denny Chin); Copies mailed. (sac) (Entered: 06/15/2001)
06/29/2001	5	AMENDED ANSWER to Complaint by The City of N.Y. (kw) (Entered: 07/02/2001)
07/03/2001	6	ANSWER to Complaint by The City of N.Y. (Attorney Barbara B. Butler from the Firm: Michael D. Hess, Corp. Counsel). (sac) (Entered: 07/09/2001)
08/06/2001	7	AMENDED COMPLAINT by Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown, Walter Beach, and Carrie Anderson (Answer due 8/20/01 for The City of N.Y. and for Henry J. Stern) amending [1-1] complaint. Jury trial demanded. (kw) Modified on 08/14/2001 (Entered: 08/14/2001)
08/06/2001	7	DEMAND for jury trial by Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown, Walter Beach, and Carrie Anderson. (kw) (Entered: 08/14/2001)
08/14/2001	8	STIPULATION and ORDER; tht dft. The City of New York represents and agrees that it is the legal entity responsible for implementing and will implement any legal or equitable relief which may be order by the Court in this aciton, including without limitation any injunctive relief such as requested by plaintiffs in the complaint, in light of the stipulation in parargaph 1 above, The N.Y.C. Dept. of Parks and Recreation shall be dropped as a separate party defendant and removed as a party defendant from the caption of this action ; plaintiffs agree to serve and file an amended complaint with the new caption and defendants agree that this technical and procedural amendment shall not constitute plaintiffs' amendment as of course pursuant to Federal Rule 15(a) . (signed by Judge Denny Chin) (pl) (Entered: 08/15/2001)
08/15/2001	9	ANSWER TO THE FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT by Henry J. Stern, The City of N.Y. (Attorney Barbara B. Butler from the Firm: Michael D. Hess). (dj) (Entered: 08/16/2001)
01/08/2002	10	ORDER, regarding the Court's decision on three discovery issues: (1) plaintiffs' request for the City's computerized databases for Parks Department employees; (2) the time frame for the production of documents and computer data; and (3) the terms of a confidentiality stipulation . (signed by Judge Denny Chin); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 01/14/2002)
01/14/2002	11	STIPULATION and PROTECTIVE ORDER; regarding procedures that will govern the handling of "Confidential Materials" . (signed by Judge Denny Chin) (sn) (Entered: 01/15/2002)
01/23/2002	12	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Chin from Amy F. Melican, dated 1/18/02; counsel writes to request that defendants' time to object to plaintiffs' request for fields from the Citywide Personnel System and DPR Seasonal System be extended to 2/15/02. The date for objections is extended until 2/7/02; the date for producing the data is extended until 30 calendar days after resolution of the objections . (signed by Judge Denny Chin); Copies mailed. (kkc) (Entered: 01/23/2002)
01/25/2002	13	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Chin from Cynthia Rollings, dated 1/22/02. Re: plaintiffs write in response to defendants' 1/18/02 letter. My 1/22/02 Order stands. The new deadlines apply only to the Computer data in question. Document discovery shall otherwise proceed as scheduled . (signed by Judge Denny Chin); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 01/30/2002)
02/06/2002	15	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Chin from Amy F. Melican, dated 2/5/02; approving counsel for depts' request that depts' time to object to plttfs' request for fields from the Citywide Personnel System and DPR Seasonal Tracking

		System be extended to 2/11/02 ; and both parties' time to serve their responses and objections to interrogatories and document requests be extended to 2/21/02 . (signed by Judge Denny Chin); Copies mailed. (sn) (Entered: 02/08/2002)
02/07/2002	14	Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for Settlement; Referred to Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger. (signed by Judge Denny Chin) (pl) (Entered: 02/08/2002)
02/28/2002	16	ORDER; reset settlement conference for 2:30 p.m. on 3/7/02, in Courtroom 17D, 500 Pearl Street, NY, NY ; (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed. (dj) (Entered: 03/04/2002)
03/26/2002	17	ORDER, plntfs are to identify to defts the computer fields for which they require more specific descriptions of the field's contents. This is to be done at the conclusion of the conference on 3/21/02. Defts are to provide the requested information by 3/26/02, as further set forth in this document ; set oral argument for 9:00 4/15/02, on those issues (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed. (cd) (Entered: 03/27/2002)
03/27/2002	18	Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge Dolinger for Gen. Pretrial/After Initial Case Management Conference held by District Judge. (signed by Judge Denny Chin) (kg) (Entered: 03/28/2002)
04/10/2002	19	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Barbara B. Butler, dated 4/9/02. Re: Counsel for defendants write to request an extension of time within which to respond to plaintiffs' letter motion regarding discovery and to respond to plaintiffs' 2nd Set of Interrogatories and Document Demands. Application granted . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed. (tp) Modified on 04/15/2002 (Entered: 04/15/2002)
05/14/2002	20	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Mag. Judge Dolinger from Jody L. Yetzer, dated 05/13/02; Application for extension of discovery matters granted. The schedules for briefing remaining deposition concerning document production and interrogatories is adjourned to the dates requested in this letter application; (Plaintiffs to May 29; and defendants response to June 11 ; (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); mailed. (dj) (Entered: 05/17/2002)
05/22/2002	21	ORDER, that the next day of defendant Henry J. Stern's deposition is to be conducted on 5/28/02. Defendants are to advise plaintiffs by 5/21/02 which of the following dates Lesley Webster will be made available for deposition: June 11, 18, 19, 20 or 21, 2002 ; Defendants are to serve their answers to plaintiffs' Third Set of Interrogatories by 5/22/02 ; All documents are to be produced by 5/23/02 ; The schedule for briefing any remaining document disputes remains as set by the 5/13/02 endorsed order . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed. (tp) (Entered: 05/24/2002)
06/07/2002	22	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Dolinger from Kit T. Wong, dated 6/4/02, granting deft's request for an extension of time to 6/11/02 for defts to respond to plntfs' 5/29/02 letter brief raising outstanding discovery issues. Plntfs' time to reply to defts' 6/11/02 submissions enlarged to 6/18/02 (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed. (cd) (Entered: 06/11/2002)
06/25/2002	23	ORDER; reset oral argument with respect to counsels' unresolved discovery disputes has been scheduled in this action on 7/9/02 at 2:30 p.m., in Courtroom 17D . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed. (pl) (Entered: 06/26/2002)
07/15/2002	24	STIPULATION and ORDER; that this action is consolidated with action #02 cv 4699(DC) for all purposes, including discovery and trial . (signed by Judge Denny Chin) (jp) (Entered: 07/16/2002)
07/15/2002		Consolidated Lead Case. (jp) (Entered: 07/16/2002)
07/15/2002	25	ORDER; case nos. 01 cv 4437 and 02 cv 4699 have been consolidated for all purposes. Pltffs in 01 cv 4437 shall file an amended complaint to add Title VII claims by 7/18/02. Their class certification motion is due on 9/20/02. Defts shall file their opposition papers by 10/18/02, and plttf shall file their reply papers, if any, by 11/1/02. All discovery shall be completed by 12/6/02, and a pretrial

		conference will be held that day at 10:00 AM . (signed by Judge Denny Chin); Copies mailed. (sn) (Entered: 07/17/2002)
07/16/2002	26	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Jody Yetzer, dated 7/12/02; Granting counsel for the parties request for the Court to modify its prior orders with regard to filing papers relating to disputes within 40 hours to allow that 48 hour period to begin to run from the close of business on Tuesday. If any issues remain requiring Court intervention, plttfs will then, within 48 hours, submit a letter brief to the Court addressing those issues . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed. (jp) (Entered: 07/19/2002)
07/18/2002	27	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Second Amended Class Action Complaint by hand delivery on 7/16/02 on behalf of defendants to Barbara Butler and/or Kit Wong, Assistant Corporation Counsel. (tp) (Entered: 07/22/2002)
07/23/2002	28	ORDER, that a pre-trial conference has been scheduled in the above-captioned action on Tuesday, August 13, 2002 at 10:00 a.m., in Courtroom 17D, 500 Pearl Street . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed. (dle) (Entered: 07/26/2002)
07/25/2002	29	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Jody L. Yetzer, dated 7/23/02: Granting plaintiffs request for extension of time until 7/24/02 to reply to defendants' submission . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed. (tp) (Entered: 07/26/2002)
07/26/2002	30	ORDER, plntfs having requested permission to intervene in 02 cv 4699, the application is hereby granted (signed by Judge Denny Chin); Copies mailed; also docketed in 01 cv 4699 (cd) (Entered: 07/29/2002)
07/26/2002	31	SECOND AMENDED COMPLAINT by Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown, Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson (Answer due 8/5/02 for NYC Dept. Parks, for The City of N.Y., for N.Y.C. Department, for Henry J. Stern) (Government Answer due 8/5/02 for NYC Dept. Parks, for The City of N.Y., for N.Y.C. Department, for Henry J. Stern) amending [1-1] complaint . Summons issued. (sb) (Entered: 07/31/2002)
07/31/2002	32	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Barbara Butler, dated 7/30/02. Re: defendants write regarding a discovery dispute. If the parties are unable to resolve this matter amongst themselves, it will be dealt with at the 8/13/02 scheduled conference . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed. (kw) Modified on 08/07/2002 (Entered: 08/07/2002)
08/02/2002	33	INTERVENOR'S COMPLAINT by Robert Wright, Kathleen Walder, Henry Roman, Elezabeth Rogers, David Lee Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown, and Carrie L. Anderson against The City of N.Y., NYC Dept. Parks . Summons issued. (dle) (Entered: 08/08/2002)
08/02/2002	34	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of intervenors complaint as to The City of N.Y., NYC Dept. Parks by U.S.Postal Service on 7/30/02 . Answer due on 8/19/02 for The City of N.Y., for NYC Dept. Parks . (dle) (Entered: 08/08/2002)
08/21/2002	35	ANSWER by Henry J. Stern, The City of N.Y. to [33-1] intervenor complaint Firm of: Corporation Counsel by attorney Barbara B. Butler for intervenor-defendant The of N.Y. (db) (Entered: 08/26/2002)
08/30/2002	36	Transcript of record of proceedings before Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger for the date(s) of July 9, 2002. (jw) (Entered: 08/30/2002)
09/17/2002	37	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Chin from Jody Yetzer/Lewis M. Steel, dated 9/10/02, Deadline for filing of plntfs' class certification motion by 11/1/02, response due by 12/6/02, reply due by 12/23/02; Fact Discovery cutoff 1/17/03 (signed by Judge Denny Chin); Copies mailed. (cd) Modified on 09/19/2002 (Entered: 09/18/2002)
09/17/2002		Deadline(s) updated: Response to motion deadline 12/6/02 ; Reply to response to motion deadline 12/23/02 (cd) (Entered: 09/19/2002)

10/30/2002	38	Transcript of record of proceedings before Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger for the date(s) of 10/15/02. (yv) (Entered: 11/01/2002)
11/06/2002	39	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Mag. Judge Dolinger from Judy L. Yetzer, dated 11/04/02; Plaintiffs' class certification motion due 11/27/02; Defendants' Response to motion deadline due 1/10/03; Plaintiffs' Reply to response to motion deadline due 1/27/03 ; (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies faxed by Chambers; (djc) (Entered: 11/07/2002)
11/18/2002	40	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Chin from Jody Yetzer and Lewis M. Steel, dated 11/6/02. Re: parties request an enlargement of the page limitation for the memorandum of law from 25 pages to 75 pages. Application granted but only to the extent as follows: Pl. br. - 50 pages.; def. br. - 50 pages; Reply br. - 25 pages . (signed by Judge Denny Chin); (kw) (Entered: 11/19/2002)
11/27/2002	41	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault. (js) (Entered: 12/03/2002)
11/27/2002	42	NOTICE OF MOTION by Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown, Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson for an order for class certification . No Return Date. (sb) (Entered: 12/04/2002)
11/27/2002	43	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown, Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson in support of [42-1] motion for an order for class certification. Volume I of Deposition Testimony and Interview Statements and Volume II of Documentary Evidence attached. (sb) Modified on 12/04/2002 (Entered: 12/04/2002)
11/27/2002	44	JOINT AFFIDAVIT of Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown, Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson by Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown, Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson in support of [42-1] motion for an order for class certification and supporting affidavits of present and former parks employees and union representative of parks employees. (sb) Modified on 12/04/2002 (Entered: 12/04/2002)
11/27/2002	45	DECLARATION OF COUNSEL of Cynthia Rollings and Lewis M. by Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown, Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson in support of [42-1] motion for an order for class certification . (sb) (Entered: 12/04/2002)
12/06/2002	46	Transcript of record of proceedings before Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger for the date(s) of 10/15/02. (dt) (Entered: 12/06/2002)
12/06/2002	47	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Chin from A.U.S.A., dated 12/3/02. The plaintiffs request that the 12/6/02 pretrial conference be rescheduled for sometime in February 2003. The pretrial conference scheduled for 12/6/02 is adjourned until 2/21/03 at 11:00 a.m. If any party believes a conference before then to discuss settlement would be helpful, the court will schedule one. (signed by Judge Denny Chin) (sb) (Entered: 12/10/2002)
12/06/2002	48	Memorandum to Docket Clerk:, for a conference held before Magistrate Judge Dolinger on 12/6/02 . (dle) (Entered: 12/12/2002)
12/30/2002	49	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Chin from Barbara R. Butler, dated 12/19/02; Re: defendants respectfully sumti this letter appealing so much of Mag. Judge Dolinger's orders at the conference on 12/6/02 as set forth in this letter; upon renew of this letter, the Government's response dated 12/20/02, and the exhibits attached to both letters. Judge Dolinger's orders are affirmed in all respects . (signed by Judge Denny Chin); (pl) (Entered: 01/06/2003)
01/06/2003	50	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Kit T. Wong, dated 12/30/02; granting defts until Friday, 1/3/03 to respond to the letter to Your Honor dated 12/27/02. (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); (sac) (Entered: 01/09/2003)

01/13/2003	51	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Chin from Kit T. Wong, dated 01/09/03; the time for defendants' service of their opposition to Wright plaintiffs' motion for class certification is extended from January 10, 2003 to February 7, 2003; Wright plaintiffs' time for service of their reply to defendants' opposition is extended from January 27, 2003 to February 28, 2003. Final . (signed by Judge Denny Chin); (djc) (Entered: 01/15/2003)
01/13/2003	52	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER; at a telephone conference conducted today, counsel for the class plaintiffs applied to the court for an order precluding the participation in this lawsuit on defendants' behalf of attorneys from the law firm Clifford Chance unless that firm, or at least its individual attorneys, filed a notice of appearance. The request is denied ; (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed by Chambers; (djc) Modified on 01/16/2003 (Entered: 01/15/2003)
01/14/2003	53	MEMORANDUM & ORDER, Plaintiffs' application to compel further discovery response from defendants is granted in its entirety. Supplemental production of the requested documents and information is to be completed in two weeks. (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed by Chambers. (sb) (Entered: 01/16/2003)
01/24/2003	54	Letter filed by Henry J. Stern, The City of N.Y., NYC Dept. Parks, The City of N.Y., NYC Dept. Parks addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Kit T. Wong, dated 1/23/03, re: Counsel for defendants request a conference call between the Court and counsel for all parties. (tp) (Entered: 01/28/2003)
01/24/2003	55	Letter filed by Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Carrie Anderson, Jacqueline Brown, Walter Beach addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Jody L. Yetzer, dated 1/23/03, re: Counsel for plaintiffs' request that the City's objection to the deposition of Mr. Newfield be overruled. (tp) (Entered: 01/28/2003)
01/24/2003	56	Letter filed by Henry J. Stern, The City of N.Y., NYC Dept. Parks, The City of N.Y., NYC Dept. Parks addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Kit. T. Wong, dated 1/23/03, re: That counsel for the defendants forward to the Court and all counsel a copy of Virgin Enters. v. American Longevity, 2001 U.S. Dist LEXIS 2315 (S.D.N.Y. 2001). (tp) (Entered: 01/28/2003)
01/24/2003	57	Transcript of record of proceedings before Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger for the date(s) of 7/9/02. (yv) (Entered: 01/30/2003)
02/03/2003	58	Transcript of record of proceedings before Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger for the date(s) of 12/6/02. (dt) (Entered: 02/03/2003)
02/07/2003	59	Transcript of record of proceedings before Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger for the date(s) of 1/23/03. (jco) (Entered: 02/13/2003)
02/28/2003	61	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown, Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson re: [42-1] motion for an order for class certification . (cd) (Entered: 03/04/2003)
02/28/2003	62	DECLARATION in further support, of Jody Lynn Yetzer by Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown, Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson in support Re: [42-1] motion for an order for class certification . (cd) (Entered: 03/04/2003)
03/03/2003	60	Transcript of record of proceedings before Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger for the date(s) of January 23, 2003. (dt) (Entered: 03/03/2003)
03/10/2003	63	ORDER, Defendants appeal from Mag. Judge Dolinger's order dated 1/13/03. Judge Chin has reviewed the parties' letters. Judge Dolinger's order is affirmed in all respects. (signed by Judge Denny Chin); Copies faxed by Chambers. (sb) (Entered: 03/11/2003)

03/27/2003	64	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Dolinger from Lewis M. Steel, Esq., dated 3/21/03. Set fact discovery due for 9/12/03 . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed by chambers. (kw) (Entered: 03/28/2003)
04/01/2003	65	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Mag. Judge Dolinger from Russell M. Yankwitt, dated 3/26/03. The Government requests that the Court order that the Government be allowed to schedule the seven hours of Commissioner Benepe's deposition for a date that is agreeable to all parties. Since the class plaintiffs will be deposing Mr. Benepe on 3/28/03, the U.S. may pursue its questioning of the witness at a later date, to be agreed to by the parties. (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed by Chambers. (sb) Modified on 04/02/2003 (Entered: 04/02/2003)
04/01/2003	66	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Dolinger from Ramon E. Reyes, Jr., dated 3/27/03. Granting US's request for an extension until 4/4/03 to file reply to his motion to compel the production of documents listed on defendants' privilege logs . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed by chambers. (kw) (Entered: 04/02/2003)
04/09/2003	67	ORDER; that upon plaintiffs' application, the deadline for serving their reply papers in support of their motion to compel is extended to 4/25/03 . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); copies mailed by chambers (pl) (Entered: 04/11/2003)
04/24/2003	68	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Dolinger from Ramon E. Reyes, Jr., dated 4/23/03. counsel for the Government requests an indefinite extension to reply to defendants' 3/24/03 submission in opposition to the Government's motion to compel the production of non-privileged documents. Application for an "indefinite" extension denied. The parties are to pursue their efforts to resolve the privilege issues, and will be required, by 5/15/03 either to (a) complete their briefing or (b) report to the Court in writing the status of their efforts to resolve these issues, if those efforts are still ongoing . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); (yv) (Entered: 04/25/2003)
06/30/2003	69	ORDER, that if defendants intend to oppose the plaintiffs' revised application to compel production, which is embodied in a letter to the Court dated 5/30/03, they are to serve and file papers, including, where appropriate, affidavits, by no later than 7/3/03 . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed by Chambers. (tp) (Entered: 07/02/2003)
06/30/2003	70	SUPPLEMENTAL STIPULATION and PROTECTIVE ORDER, regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential materials . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger). Copies mailed by Chambers. (tp) (Entered: 07/02/2003)
07/09/2003	71	ORDER; granting [42-1] motion for an order for class certification. Judge Chin holds that plaintiffs satisfy the criteria for class certification under Rule 23 and hence their motion for class certification is granted. Plaintiffs shall submit a proposed order on notice within 5 business days hereof. (signed by Judge Denny Chin); Copies picked up by Counsel of Record. (sb) (Entered: 07/09/2003)
07/25/2003	72	ORDER; this action is certified as a class action pursuant to Rule 23(b)(2) of the F.R.C.P.; the class shall consist of all former and present African-American and Hispanic full-time employees of the Dept. of Parks and Recreation of the City of New York employed at any time since 5/24/98 . (signed by Judge Denny Chin); (pl) (Entered: 07/28/2003)
07/29/2003	73	ORDER; that we direct that defendants produce the remaining documents at issue within seven days if they have not already been produced . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); copies mailed by chambers (pl) Modified on 07/30/2003 (Entered: 07/30/2003)
08/29/2003	74	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Dolinger from Barbara B. Butler, dated 8/19/03. Granting defendants' request for an extension until 8/28/03 to respond to the Court's letter dated 8/8/03. No further extension. Plaintiffs will have one week to reply . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); (kw) (Entered: 09/03/2003)

08/29/2003	76	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Mag. Judge Dolinger from Kit T. Wong, dated 8/19/03; Re: defendants request that the defendants have until Monday, 8/25/03 to respond to the letter to Your Honor dated 8/8/03 from counsel for Wright plaintiffs regarding discovery issues; application granted: defendants are also expected to respond to plaintiffs' 8/20/03 letter regarding document coping. This is to be due by 8/27/03 . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); (pl) (Entered: 09/04/2003)
09/02/2003	75	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Mag. Judge Dolinger from Sherri R. Rosenberg; granting requests for extension of time to respond to Wright Plaintiffs' 8/25/03 Letter re: Attorney Client Privilege and Attorney Work Product Protections . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); (pl) (Entered: 09/03/2003)
10/20/2003	77	ORDER, in the absence of any justification for precluding the depositions of Messrs. Riley, Friedenber, Ms. Daniels, and Ms. O'Keefe, the parties are to schedule and take them. If any of these witnesses is not subject to a notice of deposition without subpoena, the deposing party is to promptly arrange for service of a subpoena . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed by Chambers on 10/20/03. (yv) (Entered: 10/22/2003)
10/20/2003	78	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Chin from Myron Beldock and Lewis M. Steel, dated 10/10/03. Granting plaintiffs' request that the NAACP Legal Defense and Educational Fund, Inc. become co-counsel of record for the plaintiff class . signed by Judge Denny Chin); Copies faxed by chambers. (kw) (Entered: 10/23/2003)
11/03/2003	79	NOTICE of attorney appearance for Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown, Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson by Robert H. Stroup. (moc) (Entered: 11/05/2003)
11/03/2003	80	NOTICE of attorney appearance for Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown, Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson by Melissa S. Woods. (moc) (Entered: 11/05/2003)
11/05/2003		Transcript of record of proceedings before Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger for the date(s) of 9/24/03. Original Filed in case#02cv4699, Doc.#14. (df) (Entered: 11/05/2003)
11/10/2003	81	ORDER; By letter dated October 23, 2003, defendant requests that the Court redefine the class to exclude class members noticed to be deposed by plaintiffs who have decided they do not want to be included in the class. Plaintiffs oppose the request. The request for redefinition of the class is denied with the caveats as stated in this Order ; (signed by Judge Denny Chin); Copies faxed by Chambers; (dj) (Entered: 11/12/2003)
11/18/2003	82	ORDER, that a pretrial conference has been scheduled in this action on Friday 11/21/03 at 12:00 noon, at which time you are directed to appear in Courtroom 17D, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 . (signed by Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger); Copies mailed by Chambers. (tp) (Entered: 11/20/2003)
12/18/2003	83	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 10/21/03 before Judge Michael H. Dolinger.(jf,) (Entered: 12/18/2003)
12/30/2003	84	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Sherri R. Rosenberg dated 12/22/03 re: Counsel requests that defendants have until 12/29/03 to respond to the letter dated 12/18/03 from counsel for Wright plaintiffs regarding discovery issues requiring court intervention. Application granted. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 12/22/03) (sb,) (Entered: 01/15/2004)
12/30/2003	85	MEMORANDUM & ORDER; The Court directs that plaintiffs' counsel advise defendants' attorneys in writing of the names and positions (if known) of any current employees of the Department whom they may wish to interview, as further set forth on this order. The Court directs that plaintiffs' counsel refrain from seeking to elicit from any present or former Department employee any attorney-client communications, and (2) that defendants refrain from any suggestion or instruction to a Department employee who is to be interviewed by

		plaintiffs' representatives that the employee should not do so. Plaintiffs' counsel is to advise the employee that he or she is free to decline. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 12/24/03) Copies Mailed By Chambers.(sb,) (Entered: 01/15/2004)
01/29/2004	86	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 1/7/04 before Judge Michael H. Dolinger.(pr,) (Entered: 01/29/2004)
03/04/2004	87	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 2/24/04 before Judge Michael H. Dolinger.(cd,) (Entered: 03/09/2004)
03/25/2004	88	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 1/7/04 before Judge Michael H. Dolinger.(tr,) (Entered: 03/25/2004)
03/29/2004	89	ORDER the application by plaintiffs for further examination of David Stark on topics other than those specified in the endorsed order dated 3/24/04 is denied. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 3/25/04) "Copies Mailed By Chambers".(jco,) (Entered: 03/30/2004)
03/29/2004	90	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Michael H. Dolinger from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 3/24/04 re: Counsel for defendants writes in response to the U.S. 3/23/04 letter request to the Court for permission to continue the deposition of David Starks, a Parks Department employee, for a third day. Plaintiffs and the Government may take the depositions of Mr. Stark for one hour and Mr. Wong for two hours in the subject of the "Mangerial Posters". The court will not otherwise limit the subject-matter of these brief depositions. The parties are to schedule them promptly. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 3/24/04) "Copies Faxed By Chambers"(jco,) (Entered: 03/31/2004)
03/30/2004	91	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 3/25/04 re: defendant requests the Court's permission to serve a set of contention interrogatories that may exceed the limit of 25 permitted by Rule 33(a) of the FRCP. Defendants may serve contention interrogatories on the same schedule as requested & Order. The Court declines to approve in advance the use of an unspecified number of interrogatories in excess of twenty five. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 3/29/04) (kw,) Modified on 4/5/2004 (kg,). (Entered: 04/02/2004)
04/02/2004	92	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 2/24/04 before Judge Michael H. Dolinger.(dfe,) (Entered: 04/02/2004)
04/02/2004	93	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 2/24/04 before Judge Michael H. Dolinger.(dfe,) (Entered: 04/02/2004)
04/27/2004	94	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Michael H. Dolinger from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 4/21/04 re: Counsel on behalf of all parties write to request that the Court approve certain modifications to the schedule for the sanction motions, responses to requests for admissions and contention interrogatories, and expert discovery as further set forth in this letter. The proposed modified pretrial schedule is adopted. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 4/22/04) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:01-cv-04437-DC-MHD,1:02-cv-04699-DC-MHD(jco,) (Entered: 04/28/2004)
05/04/2004	95	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Mag. Judge Dolinger from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 5/3/04 re: granting dft requests for a two day extension of time to serve their sanctions' motion. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 5/3/04) Copies mailed by chambers.(pl,) (Entered: 05/05/2004)
05/07/2004	96	MOTION for Sanctions. Document filed by Carrie Anderson, Walter Beach, Jacqueline Brown, Angelo Colon, Paula Loving, Odessa Portlette, David Ray, Elizabeth Rogers, Henry Roman, Kathleen Walker, Robert Wright. Affidavit of Vekker and Declaration of Yetzer attached. (jco,) (Entered: 05/10/2004)
05/07/2004	97	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 96 MOTION for Sanctions. (jco,) Appendix to class plaintiffs' motion sanctions attached. (Entered: 05/10/2004)
05/12/2004	98	ORDER; upon the declaration of Lewis M. Steel and the consent of the parties it is Ordered that Lewis M. Steel is substituted for the law firm of Sttel Bellman Ritz and Clark, P.C. as one of the attorneys for the plaintiffs and the class they

		represent. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 5/11/04) copies faxed by chambers.(dj,) (Entered: 05/14/2004 (copies faxed by chambers. (Entered: 05/14/2004)
06/23/2004	99	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 6/8/04 before Judge Michael H. Dolinger.(dfe,) (Entered: 06/23/2004)
07/07/2004	100	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 6/8/04 at 4:00 p.m. before Judge Michael H. Dolinger.(ph,) (Entered: 07/23/2004)
09/03/2004	101	ORDER: the government and class plaintiffs to serve letter/briefs by 9/10/04; defendants to serve responses by 9/24/04; defendants response to motion for sanctions due 10/1/04; movants reply due 10/15/04. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 9/1/04) Copies Mailed by Chambers.(db,) (Entered: 09/08/2004)
09/03/2004		Set/Reset Deadlines as to 96 MOTION for Sanctions.. Responses due by 10/1/2004 Replies due by 10/15/2004. (db,) (Entered: 09/08/2004)
09/09/2004	102	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Dolinger from Melissa Woods dated 9/8/04; this letter accurately summarizes the terms agreed to at the 9/1/04 telephone conference. The written order issued that date is deemed amended to conform to those terms. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 9/8/04) (cd,) (Entered: 09/13/2004)
09/15/2004		ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Lisa R. Zornberg dated 9/10/2004 re: The Government and plaintiff's submission to be filed by no later then 9/17/2004. Defendant's response is due by 10/15/2005. So Ordered Original filed on 02cv4699. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 9/10/2004) (jsa,) (Entered: 09/17/2004)
09/30/2004	103	ORDER Pretrial Conference set for 10/15/2004 10:00 AM before Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 9/29/2004) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:01-cv-04437-DC-MHD,1:02-cv-04699-DC-MHD(jp,) (Entered: 10/01/2004)
10/05/2004	104	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 96 MOTION for Sanctions. Document filed by New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, The City of New York. (dj,) (Entered: 10/07/2004)
10/05/2004	105	DECLARATION of Barbara B. Butler in Support of Defendants' Response to the United States' Sanctions Motion. Document filed by New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, The City of New York. (dj,) (Entered: 10/07/2004)
10/05/2004	106	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 96 MOTION for Sanctions. Document filed by New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, Henry J. Stern, The City of New York. (jco,) (Entered: 10/08/2004)
10/05/2004	107	DECLARATION of Barbara B. Butler. (jco,) (Entered: 10/08/2004)
10/05/2004	108	DECLARATION of Thomas Giannattasio. (jco,) (Entered: 10/08/2004)
10/05/2004	109	DECLARATION of Kathleen M. Comfrey. (jco,) (Entered: 10/08/2004)
10/20/2004	110	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER;... Clarification of an order issued on December 24, 2003, which limited the access of counsel for plaintiffs to employees of the Parks Dept in connection with this litigation... (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 10/18/04) (dj,) (Entered: 10/22/2004)
10/29/2004	111	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 96 MOTION for Sanctions. Document filed by Carrie Anderson, Walter Beach, Jacqueline Brown, Angelo Colon, Paula Loving, Odessa Portlette, David Ray, Elizabeth Rogers, Henry Roman, Kathleen Walker, Robert Wright.(db,) (Entered: 11/01/2004)
11/04/2004	112	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Lisa R. Zornberg ated 10/28/2004 re: the time to submit a reply brief in support of the Government's motion for sanctions is extended to 11/5/2004. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 10/28/2004) (jsa,) (Entered: 11/05/2004)

11/04/2004		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Replies due by 11/5/2004. (jsa,) (Entered: 11/05/2004)
11/05/2004	113	AMENDED DECLARATION of Lisa Zornberg re: amending declaration in support of the U.S.' motion for sanctions against defendants. (pl,) (Entered: 11/09/2004)
11/05/2004	114	NOTICE of Change of Address by Lewis M. Steel on behalf of Robert Wright. New Address: Outten & Golden LLP, 3 Park Avenue, 29th Floor, New York, New York, 10016, (212) 245-1000. (pl,) (Entered: 11/10/2004)
11/12/2004	115	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Dolinger from Kathleen Comfrey dated 11/8/04: if defts feel compeled to address the govt's argument about the 12/6/02 order, they may do so by serving and filing sur reply papers addressd only to that issue by 11/12/04. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 11/8/0(cd,) (Entered: 11/15/2004)
11/15/2004	116	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 96 MOTION for Sanctions. Document filed by New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, Henry J. Stern, The City of New York. (kw,) (Entered: 11/18/2004)
11/15/2004	117	DECLARATION of Kathleen M. Comfrey in Support re: 116 Memorandum of Law in Oppisition to Motion. Document filed by New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, Henry J. Stern, The City of New York. (kw,) (Entered: 11/18/2004)
11/23/2004	118	LETTER addressed to Judge Dolinger from Russell Yankwit dated 11/10/2004 re: a response to defts letter brief challenging nine categories of the Governments response to certain requests for admissions. (jp,) (Entered: 11/23/2004)
12/27/2004	119	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Russell M. Yankwitt dated 12/22/2004 re: the government will submit their revised responses to defendants by 1/7/2005 and if defendants still wish to challenge the responses, defendants will submit a letter brief to the Court by 1/21/2005. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 12/22/2004) (jsa,) Modified on 12/29/2004 (jsa,). copies mailed by chambers (Entered: 12/29/2004)
12/29/2004	120	Memorandum and Order The class plaintiffs seek an order compelling defendants to respond to their contention interrogatories 22 and 23. (Dec. 13, 2004 letter to the Court from Lewis M. Steel.Esq.). The application is granted. Copies mailed by chambers. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 12/23/2004) (Entered: 01/03/2005)
01/03/2005	122	LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Michael H. Dolinger from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 12/30/04 re: defendants' reply to class plaintiffs' 12/22/04 letter. Document filed by Henry J. Stern, The City of New York, New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, The City of New York, New York City Department of Parks and Recreation.(sac,) (Entered: 01/06/2005)
01/04/2005		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Michael H. Dolinger : Interim Pretrial Conference held on 1/4/2005. (jeh,) (Entered: 01/19/2005)
01/06/2005	121	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 01/04/05 before Mag. Judge Michael H. Dolinger (es,) (Entered: 01/06/2005)
02/03/2005	125	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Kathleen M. Comfrey re: application granted. Defendant's have an extension until 2/11/2005 to supplement their responses to the class plaintiffs' and the federal government's request for admissions which are not subject to the pending appeal ("RFAs") (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 1/28/2005) (jsa,) copies mailed to counsel by chambers Modified on 2/7/2005 (jsa,). (Entered: 02/07/2005)
02/03/2005	126	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Dolinger from Lewis M. Steel dated 1/28/2005 re: application granted. The Wright plaintiff's may have until 2/11/2005 to supplement their responses to certain of the defendant's request to admit. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 1/28/2005) copies mailed to counsel by chambers.(jsa,) (Entered: 02/07/2005)

02/03/2005		Set/Reset Deadlines: Defendants Supplemental Responses due by 2/11/2005 (jsa,) (Entered: 02/07/2005)
02/03/2005		Set/Reset Deadlines: Wright Plaintiffs supplemental Responses due by 2/11/2005 (jsa,) (Entered: 02/07/2005)
02/05/2005	123	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 1/4/2005 @ 2:45 pm before Judge Michael H. Dolinger. (mbe,) (Entered: 02/05/2005)
02/05/2005	124	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 1/31/05 before Judge Denny Chin. (kj,) (Entered: 02/05/2005)
02/05/2005	127	LETTER addressed to Judge Dolinger from Kathleen Comfrey dated 1/24/05: that the govt be ordered to answer the interrogatory fully. Document filed by Robert Wright.(cd,) (Entered: 02/10/2005)
02/07/2005	130	LETTER addressed to Mag. Michael H. Dolinger from Russell M. Yank Witt dated 2/7/05 re: The Federal Government has already twice supplemental their repsonse to address dfts' concerns. (pl,) (Entered: 02/16/2005)
02/10/2005	128	STIPULATION AND ORDER that no party will raise any issue as to the appropriateness of Judge Chin trying either or both 01cv4437 and 02cv4699 if the mediation fails to result in a complete resolution of the issued raised in either of these consolidated actions as a result of his role in mediating these cases; this stipulation is binding on all parties to this case, as well as any person substituted as a party in these cases and their counsel or any future counsel. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 2/10/05) (dle,) (Entered: 02/14/2005)
02/15/2005	129	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 2/4/05 before Judge Michael H. Dolinger. (Martin, Leslie) (Entered: 02/15/2005)
02/15/2005	131	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Dolinger from Sherri Rosenberg dated 2/11/05: granting defts a one week extension to produce one category of documents covered in the 2/4/05 order. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 2/11/05) (cd,) (Entered: 02/17/2005)
02/17/2005	132	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Mag. Judge Dolinger from Russell M. Yankwitt dated 2/14/05 re: granting counsel's request for a two-day extension from February 14, 2005 to Feb. 16, 2005 to submit the civil service title information to defendants that is necessary for the parties to finalize their Stipulation. Defendants consent to this request upon the condition that (i) the deadline for finalizing a stipulation be extended from Feb. 28, 2005 to March 2, 2005 and the Federal Government will not seek an extension to serve its expert report as a result of this extension. (Signed by Judge Michael H. Dolinger on 2/14/05) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:01-cv-04437-DC-MHD,1:02-cv-04699-DC-MHD(djc,) (Entered: 02/23/2005)
03/30/2005	133	ORDER that on consent of all parties the motions for sanctions (doc #96 and doc #18 in 02-4699 are hereby withdrawn without prejudice. If any party wishes to renew its motion, it may do so by letter renewing a previously fld motion or by filing a new motion and submitting new papers. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 3/28/05) (cd,) (Entered: 04/01/2005)
04/20/2005	134	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Lisa R. Zornberg dated 4/15/05 re: Application GRANTED. Parties have until 4/22/05 to resolved settlement issues and a settlement conference will occur during the week of 4/25-29/05. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 4/19/05) (db,) (Entered: 04/22/2005)
05/02/2005	135	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Barbara B. Butler dated 4/2/05 re: Counsel for defendants writes to object to the U.S. request for a sixty day extension. The Court has reviewed the US's letter of 4/26/05, plaintiffs' letter of 4/26/05, the City's letter dated 4/27/05. It would be highly unfair to grant the US a 60-day extension while requiring the City to comply with the May 31st deadline. Under the circumstances, the dates for all further submissions, including expert reports and summary judgment papers, are extended 30 days. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 4/28/05) (jco,) (Entered: 05/04/2005)

05/19/2005	136	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Russell M. Yankwitt dated 5/17/05 re: requesting a one-week extension from 5/31/05 to 6/6/05 to serve the Government's expert report. Application granted. All deadlines are extended one week. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 5/19/05) (kw,) (Entered: 05/20/2005)
08/04/2005	137	MOTION to Bifurcate. Document filed by Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson, Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown. (dj,) (Entered: 08/05/2005)
08/04/2005	138	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 137 MOTION to Bifurcate.. Document filed by Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson, Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown. (dj,) (Entered: 08/05/2005)
08/04/2005	139	THIRD AMENDED AND SUPPLEMENTAL CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT amending 1 Complaint against Adrian Benepe, Henry J. Stern, The City of New York.Document filed by Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson, Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown. Related document: 1 Complaint.(yv,) (Entered: 08/10/2005)
08/04/2005		Set Answer Due Date purs. to 139 Amended Complaint, as to Henry J. Stern answer due on 8/18/2005; The City of New York answer due on 8/18/2005. (yv,) (Entered: 08/10/2005)
08/10/2005	140	STIPULATION AND ORDER; Purs to Rule 15, FRCP plaintiffs are permitted to amend and supplement their complaint as provided in Plaintiffs' Third Amended and Suupplemental Complaint, which is hereby allowed to be filed and served; In light of the Supreme Court's decision in Jones v. R.R.Donnelley & Sons, 541 U.S. 369 (2004), the class is redefined to include as class members for the section 1981 claims all former and present African-American and Hispanic full time employees of the Dept. of Parks and Recreation of the City of NY employed at any time since May 24, 1007, excepting those employees excluded from the class by the Court's order of Novembr 7, 2004. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 8/10/05) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:01-cv-04437-DC-MHD,1:02-cv-04699-DC-MHD(dj,) (Entered: 08/12/2005)
08/16/2005	141	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 8/12/05 re: Counsel for defendants submit this letter to request a two week extension of the deadline for submitting their responsive expert from 8/19/05 until 9/2/05 and propose the following schedule: 12/9/05- Summary Judgment motion; 1/6/06 response ;1/20/06 reply. Approved. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 8/15/05) (jco,) (Entered: 08/22/2005)
08/16/2005		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Motions due by 12/9/2005. Replies due by 1/20/2006. Responses due by 1/6/2005 (jco,) (Entered: 08/22/2005)
08/18/2005	142	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 8/16/2005 re: request for and extension of the deadlines for submitting responsive and reply papers in connection with Plaintiffs' Set Deadlines/Hearing as to 137 MOTION to Bifurcate. Responses due by 9/23/2005 Replies due by 10/10/2005. ENDORSEMENT: Approved (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 8/12/2005) (jmi,) (Entered: 08/23/2005)
09/23/2005	143	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 137 MOTION to Bifurcate.. Document filed by Henry J. Stern, New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, The City of New York. Filed In Associated Cases: 1:01-cv-04437-DC-MHD,1:02-cv-04699-DC-MHD(jmi,) (Entered: 09/27/2005)
10/03/2005	144	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Chin from Melissa Woods dated 9/28/05: re rebuttal expert reports are currently due on 10/3/05 and request to extend to 10/31: application granted, but only to the extent all existing deadlines are extended by two weeks each. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 9/30/05) (cd,) (Entered: 10/05/2005)

10/11/2005	145	PLAINTIFFS' REPLY MEMORANDUM in response to defendants' brief in opposition to plaintiffs' re: 137 MOTION to Bifurcate.. Document filed by Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson, Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown. (jmi,) (Entered: 10/12/2005)
10/19/2005	146	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Melissa S. Woods dated 10/17/05 re: Application DENIED. Except that plaintiff's are given until close of business on 10/20/05 to produce the rebuttal report of Dr. Schneider. If the City has failed to meet its discovery obligations, that failure will be addressed seperately. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 10/17/05) (db,) (Entered: 10/20/2005)
11/01/2005	147	ORDER: It is hereby ordered as follows: with respect to recently identified witnesses, plaintiffs may identify 2 additional witnesses who will be permitted to testify at trial; defendants shall have an opportunity to depose these witnesses: fact discovery is reopened to this extent only; Defendants need not file an amended answer; all other rulings are set forth in this order. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 10/28/2005) (lb,) (Entered: 11/01/2005)
12/05/2005	148	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Sherri R. Rosenberg dated 12/1/05. ENDORSEMENT: Mr. Croft's deposition is adjourned, without date. Plaintiffs may not, in opposing summary judgment, rely on or use in any fashion any statements of or information related to or garnered from Mr. Croft or NYC Parks Advocates. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 12/2/05) (js,) (Entered: 12/06/2005)
12/09/2005	149	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 11/3/2005 before Judge Denny Chin. (jar,) (Entered: 12/09/2005)
12/12/2005	150	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 11/3/05 before Judge Denny Chin. (jbe,) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/22/2005	151	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 12/21/05 re: a request that the deadline for the brief be extended until 4 days after the end of the strike. ENDORSEMENT: Approved. The other dates are extended by the corresponding number of days. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 12/21/05) (kco,) (Entered: 12/23/2005)
12/30/2005	152	MOTION for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Henry J. Stern et al. (cd,) (Entered: 01/03/2006)
12/30/2005	153	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support (accompanied with 6 volumes of exhibits) re: 152 MOTION for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Henry J. Stern et al. (cd,) (Entered: 01/03/2006)
01/18/2006	154	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 11/3/05 before Judge Denny Chin. (lma,) (Entered: 01/18/2006)
01/24/2006	155	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Lweis M. Steel dated 1/19/2006 re: to request a 45 day extension for the filing of our opposition to The City of New Yor's motion for summary judgment on all plaintiffs' class claims and many of plaintiffs' individual claims and for an order precluding the testimony of plaintiffs' expert witnesses. Our opposition papers are currently due on January 26th. Responses due by 2/27/2006 Replies due by 3/13/2006. ENDORSEMENT: This application is granted only to the extent the date for opposition is extended 30 days, to 2/27/06. Reply papers shall be severed and file 3/13/06. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 1/20/2006) (jmi,) (Entered: 01/25/2006)
02/15/2006	156	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Lewis M. Steel dated 2/9/2006 re: writing to request the Court's permission to handle appendix issues as described in this letter and to file a brief of 125 pages. ENDORSEMENT: Approved. Both sides are receiving a total of 125 pages. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 2/10/2006) (lb,) (Entered: 02/15/2006)
02/28/2006	157	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 152 MOTION for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Robert Wright. (cd,) (Entered: 03/02/2006)

02/28/2006	158	COUNTER STATEMENT TO re Local Rule 56.1. Document filed by Robert Wright. (cd,) (Entered: 03/02/2006)
02/28/2006	159	RESPONSES to Defts' Local Rule 56.1 Statement. Document filed by Robert Wright. (cd,) (Entered: 03/02/2006)
02/28/2006	160	DECLARATIONS of Cynthia Rollins et al in Opposition re: 152 MOTION for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Robert Wright. (Vol I) (cd,) (Entered: 03/02/2006)
02/28/2006	161	DEPOSITON EXHIBITS 3-98. Document filed by Robert Wright. (Vol II-A)(cd,) (Entered: 03/02/2006)
02/28/2006	162	DEPOSITION EXHIBITS 102-537. Document filed by Robert Wright. (Vol 11-B)(cd,) (Entered: 03/02/2006)
02/28/2006	163	EXHIBITS IN OPPOSITION to defts' Motion for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Robert Wright. (Vol III-A)(cd,) (Entered: 03/02/2006)
02/28/2006	164	Other Documentary Evidence. Document filed by Robert Wright. (Vol III-B) (cd,) (Entered: 03/02/2006)
02/28/2006	165	Deposition Testimony. Document filed by Robert Wright. (Vol IV) (cd,) (Entered: 03/02/2006)
02/28/2006	166	EXHIBIT (copies of previously fld documents). Document filed by Robert Wright. (Vol V)(cd,) (Entered: 03/02/2006)
02/28/2006	167	CD-Rom of depo transcripts. Document filed by Robert Wright. (Vol VI) (cd,) (Entered: 03/02/2006)
03/02/2006	168	Supplemental Appendix re deposition tesitmony in Opposition to defts' motion for summary judgment. Document filed by Robert Wright. (cd,) (Entered: 03/02/2006)
03/14/2006	169	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Barbara B. Butler dated 3/6/06 re: a request for a forty five day extension for filing a reply. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted, but only to the extent that defendants are granted an additional three weeks, to 4/3/2006. The Court does not expect defendants to respond individually to 1,603 asserted uncontested facts. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 3/7/06) (kco,) (Entered: 03/14/2006)
03/14/2006		Set Deadlines: Replies due by 4/3/2006. (kco,) (Entered: 03/14/2006)
04/03/2006	170	OPPOSITION re: 152 MOTION for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson, Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown. Revised Supplemental Appendix (DEPOSITION TESTIMONY)... Received in the night deposit box on 4/3/06 at 7:21 p.m.. (sac,) (Entered: 04/05/2006)
04/03/2006	171	OPPOSITION re: 152 MOTION for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson, Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown. Revised Volume IV (DEPOSITION TESTIMONY)... Received in the night deposit box on 4/3/06 at 7:21 p.m.. (sac,) (Entered: 04/05/2006)
04/10/2006	172	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 152 MOTION for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Henry J. Stern, The City of New York. (cd,) (Entered: 04/12/2006)
04/21/2006	173	Defendant's Supplemental Index. Document filed by Henry J. Stern, The City of New York, New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, The City of New York, New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, Adrian Benepe. (dle,) (Entered: 04/28/2006)
06/14/2006	174	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 6/8/06 re: a request that the following items be placed under seal: Volumes II, III, IV and VI in support of Defendant's summary judgment, Volumes III-A and III-B in opposition to defendant's summary judgment, Volumes VII and VIII of the

		reply materials in support of defendant's summary judgment. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 6/13/06) (kco,) (Entered: 06/14/2006)
07/25/2006	181	Joint Documentary Evidence Vol II. (cd,) (Entered: 07/26/2006)
07/25/2006	182	Joint Documentary Evidence Vol III. (cd,) (Entered: 07/26/2006)
07/25/2006	183	Joint Documentary Evidence Vol IV. (cd,) (Entered: 07/26/2006)
07/25/2006	184	Joint Declarations (Vol VI). (cd,) (Entered: 07/26/2006)
07/25/2006	185	Joint Documentary Evidence (Vol VII). (cd,) (Entered: 07/26/2006)
07/25/2006	186	Joint Documentary Evidence (Vol VIII). (cd,) (Entered: 07/26/2006)
07/26/2006	187	SEALED MATERIALS RETRIEVED: Document(s) 175,176,177,178,179 &180 were retrieved. Law Firm retrieving records: The City Of New York Law Department. Person retrieving records: Madeline Ado on 7/26/06.(kj,) (Entered: 07/26/2006)
09/06/2006	188	SEALED MATERIALS RETRIEVED: Document(s) 163 and 164 were retrieved. Law Firm retrieving records: The Law Office of Lewis M. Steel. Person retrieving records: Marwan Sehwal on 9/6/2006. (Redacted copies to be filed by firm).(kj,) (Entered: 09/06/2006)
09/06/2006	189	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 152 MOTION for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Robert Wright et al. (Vol III A-B) (cd,) (Entered: 09/07/2006)
09/15/2006	<u>190</u>	OPINION #93699; For the foregoing reasons, defednants' motion for summary judgment is granted in part and denied in part. Plaintiffs' claims of (i) discriminatory assignament of employees and allocation of funding and (ii) a racial hostile work enviroment are dismissed; their remaininf claims survive. The request to preclude plaintiffs' experts from testifying is denied, to extent set forth above. A pretrial conference will be held on October 13, 2006, at 2:00 p.m. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 9/15/2006) (jmi,) Modified on 9/21/2006 (lma,). (Entered: 09/18/2006)
09/18/2006	191	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Lewis M. Steel dated 9/8/06 re: a request to submit redacted volumes to be placed under seal pursuant to the 6/13/06 order. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 9/15/06) (kco,) (Entered: 09/18/2006)
09/22/2006		MEMO ENDORSEMENT: 152 MOTION for Summary Judgment is GRANTED IN PART AND DENIED IN PART per opinion dated 9/15/06. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 9/20/06) (db,) (Entered: 09/22/2006)
09/26/2006	192	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Jody Yetzer dated 9/22/06 re: Counsel writes to regarding footnote 1 of this Court's 9/15/06 decision and request the Court to modify it. Application Denied. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 9/26/06) (jco,) (Entered: 09/27/2006)
12/28/2006	193	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 12/22/06 re: counsel for parties request the modifications incorporated in the pretrial schedule as follows: 2/20/07 plaintiffs' witness list and exhibit list due to dfts; 3/22/07 dfts' witness list and exhibit list due to plaintiffs; plaintiff will specify deposition designations on 2/13/07 and 2/27/07; dfts will specify cross designations and objections after plaitniffs' designations and dfts' deposition designations on 3/15/07 and 3/29/07; plaintiff cross designations and objections to dfts' depositiondesignations will be specified on 4/9/07; 4/9/07 exchange of exhibit lists ; 4/16/07 proposed joint pretrial order; 5/21/07 proposed voir dire and deadline for in limine motions; responses to in limine motions due 20 days after service of motion. Application granted. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 12/22/06) (dle,) (Entered: 12/29/2006)
12/28/2006		Set/Reset Deadlines: Motions due by 5/21/2007. Pretrial Order due by 4/16/2007. (dle,) (Entered: 12/29/2006)

03/29/2007	194	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Denny Chin from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 2/22/07 re: Approved. The Court will hold a conference on 3/23/07 at 2:00 p.m., for a report on the status of settlement discussions. (See attachment for deadline modifications) (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 2/27/07) Copies Faxed by Chambers.(db) (Entered: 03/30/2007)
03/29/2007		Set/Reset Hearings: Settlement Conference set for 3/23/2007 02:00 PM before Judge Denny Chin. (db) (Entered: 03/30/2007)
06/11/2007	195	NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL: The NAACP Legal Defense and Education Fund, Inc., respectfully requests that the Clerk enter Melissa S. Woods' withdrawal as counsel in this action. The Plaintiffs will continue to be represented by other counsel from the NAACP Legal Defense and Educational Fund, Inc., as well as counsel from Beldock, Levine & Hoffman and Outten and Golden. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 6/6/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 06/12/2007)
01/25/2008	<u>196</u>	ORDER the following attorneys are permitted to bring their cell phones, blackberries, and other electronic devices into the courthouse: Robert Stroup, Cynthia Rollings, Lewis Steel, Kathleen Comfrey, Sherri Rosenberg, Ricki Miller. This order shall expire on 2/1/08, unless further extended by the Court. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 1/25/08) (jco) (Entered: 01/28/2008)
02/27/2008	<u>197</u>	ORDER GRANTING PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT AND ORDERING NOTICE TO THE CLASS: that the Court will hold a hearing at 10AM on Friday, May 12, 2008 to consider the fairness, reasonableness and adequacy of the proposed settlement. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 2/26/08) (tro) (Entered: 02/27/2008)
02/28/2008	198	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Kathleen Marie Comfrey on behalf of Henry J. Stern, The City of New York, New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, Adrian Benepe (pl) (Entered: 03/03/2008)
02/28/2008	199	JOINT MEMORANDUM OF LAW parties in support of motion for preliminary & Final Approval of Settlement Agreement. Document filed by Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson, Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown. (pl) (Entered: 03/03/2008)
03/12/2008	<u>200</u>	CONSENT ORDER: that the accompanying envelope, containing Exhibit 9 to the Proposed Stipulation & Order, be filed in the Clerk's Office and remain under seal until further Order of the Court. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 3/11/08) (tro) (Entered: 03/12/2008)
03/12/2008		Transmission to Sealed Records Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>200</u> Consent Order, to the Sealed Records Clerk for the sealing or unsealing of document or case. (tro) (Entered: 03/12/2008)
05/08/2008	<u>201</u>	ORDER: The Court had observed that its February 26, 2008 order, granting preliminary approval of the settlement agreement and ordering notice to the class, incorrectly stated that the Court would hold a fairness hearing on Friday, May 12, 2008. May 12, 2008, is a Monday. The Court will proceed with the fairness hearing on Monday, May 12, 2008. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 5/8/08) (tve) (Entered: 05/08/2008)
05/08/2008	202	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION of Lewis M. Steel in Support Of Plaintiff's Motion For Court Approval Of Attorneys Fees and Costs. Document filed by Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson, Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown. (pl) (Entered: 05/09/2008)
05/08/2008	203	DECLARATION of Robert H. Stroup in Support Of Plaintiff's Motion For Court Approval Of Attorneys Fees and Costs. Document filed by Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson, Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown. (pl) (Entered: 05/09/2008)
05/08/2008	204	JOINT DECLARATION of Cynthia Rollings, Lewis M. Steel and Robert H. Stroup in Support For Court Approval Of The Proposed Stipulation And Order

		Including Attorneys Fees and Costs. Document filed by Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson, Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown. (pl) (Entered: 05/09/2008)
05/08/2008	205	DECLARATION of Cynthia Rollings in Support Of Plaintiff's Motion For Court Approval Of Attorneys Fees and Costs. Document filed by Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson, Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown. (pl) (Entered: 05/09/2008)
05/12/2008	206	DECLARATION of Kathleen M. Comfrey in Support of Motion Court Approval of the Proposed Stipulation and Order Including Attorneys' Fees. Document filed by Henry J. Stern, The City of New York, Adrian Benepe. (db) (Entered: 05/12/2008)
05/15/2008	<u>207</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER; regarding resolution and settlement of this class action with the agreement of all the parties as set forth in this Stipulation and Order; Unless otherwise provided herein, the provisions of this Stipulation and Order shall remain in effect until 12/31/09; The City will pay a total of \$11,869,856.25 in settlement of monetary claims of Class Members, exclusive of attorneys' fees and expenses. The funds will be allocated in the manner set forth in this Stipulation and Order; The City will pay plaintiffs' attorneys fees in the following amounts: NAACP Legal Defense and Educational Fund, Inc., -- \$1,500,000; Beldock Levine & Hoffman, LLP -- \$3,440,000, Lewis M. Steel (and associate firms) -- \$3,040,000, and Steven Goldman -- \$20,000; The City will also pay plaintiffs' expenses of litigation in an amount totaling \$999,999.79; The City will pay the amounts agreed upon for fees and costs w/in 45 days of the Final Approval Date of this Stipulation and Order, or, if any appeal is filed from the Order of Final Approval, w/in 45 days of the Effective Date of this Stipulation and Order. Each of plaintiffs' counsel will provide a release relating to their professional services in this action in a form agreed upon by the parties, no later than 45 days prior to the date provided herein for payment of attorneys' fees and expenses. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 5/15/08) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:01-cv-04437-DC-MHD, 1:02-cv-04699-DC-MHD(ae) (Entered: 05/15/2008)
05/15/2008	<u>208</u>	AMENDMENT TO STIPULATION AND ORDER; Upon agreement of the parties, the amendment to the Stipulation and Order is made to correct an error in drafting as set forth in this Amendment to Stipulation and Order. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 5/15/08) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:01-cv-04437-DC-MHD, 1:02-cv-04699-DC-MHD(ae) (Entered: 05/15/2008)
05/15/2008	<u>209</u>	OPINION #96068; For the reasons set forth in this Opinion, the Agreement is approved as fair, reasonable, and adequate. The objections to the Agreement are overruled. The Court will sign the Agreement forthwith. The thirteen individuals who submitted written objections prior to the fairness hearing (and only these thirteen individuals) are hereby granted an extension of time, until 6/2/08, to opt out of this case. If they wish to opt out, they must submit a separate piece of paper in accordance with the opt-out procedures set forth in the notice to the class. The opt-out request must be in writing and it must be signed and dated; it must contain the statement set forth in the class notice; and it must be mailed to the Claims Administrator at the address set forth in the class notice, no later than 6/2/08. Any of the thirteen who does not submit an opt-out request by 6/2/2008 will not be permitted to opt out. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 5/15/08) Filed In Associated Cases: 1:01-cv-04437-DC-MHD, 1:02-cv-04699-DC-MHD(ae) Modified on 5/21/2008 (ae). (Entered: 05/15/2008)
05/19/2008	210	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 5/12/2008 before Judge Denny Chin. (ama) (Entered: 05/19/2008)
05/28/2008	211	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Matthew Colangelo on behalf of Walter Beach, Carrie Anderson, Henry J. Stern, Robert Wright, Kathleen Walker, Henry Roman, Elizabeth Rogers, David Ray, Adrian Benepe, Odessa Portlette, Paula Loving, Angelo Colon, Jacqueline Brown (dle) (Entered: 05/29/2008)

07/28/2009	<u>212</u>	ORDER: By letter dated July 6, 2009, Jasmine Burnett advises the Court that the Wright v. Stern Claims Administrator has not properly handled her claim to a portion of the settlement funds in this case. Apparently, Ms. Burnett's claim has been denied, and she is, in essence, appealing the denial. First, Ms. Burnett is directed to submit to the Court, by August 14, 2009, with copies to the Claims Administrator, copies of all of her relevant paperwork and any correspondence she received from the Claims Administrator, as well as an affidavit attesting to when she submitted her claim and by what method (e.g. first-class mail, Federal Express, etc.). Second, the Wright v. Stern Claims Administrator is hereby ordered to respond (in writing) by August 28, 2009. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 7/28/2009) (jpo) (Entered: 07/28/2009)
10/07/2009	<u>213</u>	ORDER: Nonetheless, I will give Burnett the benefit of the doubt. The Claims Administrator is directed to accept Burnett's claims form, and the deadline is waived for her. If sufficient settlement funds remain, and if Burnett otherwise qualifies for a monetary award from the settlement, the Claims Administrator is authorized to grant her claim. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Denny Chin on 10/7/09) (js) (Entered: 10/07/2009)