

CLOSED

**U.S. District Court  
District of Rhode Island (Providence)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:14-cv-00091-L-LDA**

Davidson et al v. City of Cranston, Rhode Island  
Assigned to: Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux  
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Lincoln D. Almond  
Case in other court: Court of Appeals for the First Circuit,  
CCA16-1692

Date Filed: 02/19/2014  
Date Terminated: 09/26/2016  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 441 Civil Rights: Voting  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act

**Plaintiff**

**Karen Davidson**

represented by **Lynette J. Labinger**  
Roney & Labinger LLP  
344 Wickenden Street  
Providence, RI 02903  
401-421-9794  
Fax: 401-421-0132  
Email: [Labinger@roney-labinger.com](mailto:Labinger@roney-labinger.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Adam Lioz**  
Demos  
1029 Vermont Avenue NW  
Suite 505  
Washington, DC 20036  
202-638-0190  
Email: [alioz@demoss.org](mailto:alioz@demoss.org)  
**PRO HAC VICE**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Brenda Wright**  
Demos  
358 Chestnut Hill Ave.  
Suite 303  
Brighton, MA 02459  
617-232-5885  
Email: [bwright@demoss.org](mailto:bwright@demoss.org)  
**PRO HAC VICE**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Sean J Young**  
ACLU  
125 Broad St., 18th Floor  
New York, NY 10004  
212-284-7359  
Fax: 212-549-2651  
Email: [syoung@aclu.org](mailto:syoung@aclu.org)  
**PRO HAC VICE**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**Debbie Flitman**

represented by **Lynette J. Labinger**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Adam Lioz**  
(See above for address)  
**PRO HAC VICE**

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Brenda Wright**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Sean J Young**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Plaintiff**

**Eugene Perry**

represented by **Lynette J. Labinger**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Adam Lioz**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Brenda Wright**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Sean J Young**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Plaintiff**

**Sylvia Weber**

represented by **Lynette J. Labinger**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Adam Lioz**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Brenda Wright**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Sean J Young**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Plaintiff**

**American Civil Liberties Union of  
Rhode Island, Inc.**

represented by **Lynette J. Labinger**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Adam Lioz**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Brenda Wright**

(See above for address)

*PRO HAC VICE*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sean J Young**

(See above for address)

*PRO HAC VICE*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**City of Cranston, Rhode Island**

represented by **Christopher M. Rawson**

Lovett Scheffrin Harnett

155 South Main Street

Providence, RI 02903

863-8800

Fax: 863-8938

Email: [crawson@lovettlaw.com](mailto:crawson@lovettlaw.com)

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Normand G. Benoit**

Partridge, Snow & Hahn LLP

40 Westminster Street

Suite 1100

Providence, RI 02903

401-861-8200

Fax: 401-861-8210

Email: [ngh@psh.com](mailto:ngh@psh.com)

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Robert K. Taylor**

Partridge, Snow & Hahn LLP

40 Westminster Street

Suite 1100

Providence, RI 02903

401-861-8200

Fax: 401-861-8210

Email: [rkt@psh.com](mailto:rkt@psh.com)

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**David J. Pellegrino**

Partridge, Snow & Hahn LLP

40 Westminster Street

Suite 1100

Providence, RI 02903

401-861-8200

Fax: 401-861-8210

Email: [djp@psh.com](mailto:djp@psh.com)

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

| Date Filed | #        | Docket Text                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|------------|----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 02/19/2014 | <u>1</u> | COMPLAINT ( filing fee paid \$ 400.00 receipt number 14670012913 ), filed by Karen Davidson, Debbie Flitman, Sylvia Weber, American Civil Liberties Union of Rhode Island, Inc., Eugene Perry. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 02/19/2014) |

|            |           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|------------|-----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 02/19/2014 |           | Summons Issued as to City of Cranston, Rhode Island. (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 02/19/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 02/23/2014 | <u>2</u>  | MOTION for to Appear Pro Hac Vice ( filing fee paid \$ 50.00, receipt number 0103-711898 )for admission pro hac vice of Brenda Wright filed by All Plaintiffs. (Labinger, Lynette) Docket Text Modified on 2/24/2014 (Farrell Pletcher, Paula). (Entered: 02/23/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| 02/23/2014 | <u>3</u>  | MOTION for Sean J. Young to Appear Pro Hac Vice ( filing fee paid \$ 50.00, receipt number 0103-711899 ) filed by All Plaintiffs. (Labinger, Lynette) (Entered: 02/23/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 02/26/2014 |           | TEXT ORDER granting <u>3</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice of Sean J Young. So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 2/26/14. (Cavaco, Janice) Modified on 2/26/2014 (Cavaco, Janice). (Entered: 02/26/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 02/26/2014 |           | TEXT ORDER granting <u>2</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice of Brenda Wright. So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 2/26/14. (Cavaco, Janice) Modified on 2/27/2014 (Cavaco, Janice). (Entered: 02/26/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 03/02/2014 | <u>4</u>  | SUMMONS Returned Executed by Karen Davidson, Debbie Flitman, Sylvia Weber, American Civil Liberties Union of Rhode Island, Inc., Eugene Perry. City of Cranston, Rhode Island served on 2/20/2014, answer due 3/13/2014. (Labinger, Lynette) (Entered: 03/02/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| 03/03/2014 | <u>5</u>  | NOTICE of Appearance by David J. Pellegrino on behalf of City of Cranston, Rhode Island (Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 03/03/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 03/04/2014 | <u>6</u>  | NOTICE of Appearance by Normand G. Benoit on behalf of City of Cranston, Rhode Island (Benoit, Normand) (Entered: 03/04/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 03/13/2014 | <u>7</u>  | MOTION to Dismiss filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. Responses due by 3/31/2014 (Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 03/13/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 03/13/2014 | <u>8</u>  | MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT by City of Cranston, Rhode Island in support of <u>7</u> MOTION to Dismiss . (Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 03/13/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| 03/31/2014 | <u>9</u>  | MOTION for Adam Lioz to Appear Pro Hac Vice ( filing fee paid \$ 50.00, receipt number 0103-724035 ) filed by All Plaintiffs. (Labinger, Lynette) (Entered: 03/31/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 03/31/2014 | <u>10</u> | RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>7</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint</i> With Supporting Memo filed by All Plaintiffs. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supporting Memorandum in Opposition to Motion to Dismiss)(Labinger, Lynette) (Entered: 03/31/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 04/02/2014 |           | TEXT ORDER granting <u>9</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice of Adam Lioz. So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 4/2/14. (Cavaco, Janice) (Entered: 04/02/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 04/03/2014 |           | NOTICE of Hearing on Motion <u>7</u> MOTION to Dismiss : Motion Hearing set for 4/23/2014 02:00 PM in Courtroom 4 before Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux. (Cavaco, Janice) (Entered: 04/03/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 04/04/2014 |           | NOTICE of Hearing: TIME CHANGE ONLY Motion Hearing originally set for 4/23/2014 at 02:00 PM in Courtroom 4 before Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux is CHANGED to 4/23/14 at 2:30 PM. (Cavaco, Janice) (Entered: 04/04/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| 04/07/2014 | <u>11</u> | REPLY MEMORANDUM re <u>10</u> Response in Opposition to Motion <i>to Dismiss</i> . (Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 04/07/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| 04/23/2014 |           | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux: Motion Hearing held on 4/23/2014 re <u>7</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. (Lynette Labinger, Esq., Brenda Wright, Esq., Adam Lioz, Esq., for Plaintiffs; Norman Benoit, Esq., David Pellegrino, Esq. for Defendant) Attorneys argue motion. Court takes motion under advisement for issuance of a written opinion. (Court Reporter Karen Wischnowsky in Courtroom 4 at 2:30 p.m.) (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 04/23/2014) |
| 09/08/2014 | <u>12</u> | MEMORANDUM AND ORDER Re: <u>7</u> Motion to Dismiss filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island DENIED. The Court will issue a pretrial scheduling order. So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 9/8/14. (Cavaco, Janice) (Main Document 12                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |

|            |           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|------------|-----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|            |           | replaced on 9/8/2014) (Cavaco, Janice). (Entered: 09/08/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 09/08/2014 |           | NOTICE of Hearing: Rule 16 Conference set for 9/17/2014 02:00 PM in Senior Judge Lagueux Chambers – Room 225 before Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux. (Cavaco, Janice) (Entered: 09/08/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 09/09/2014 |           | HEARING CANCELLED: Rule 16 conference set for 9/17/14 at 2:00 PM is CANCELLED. (Cavaco, Janice) (Entered: 09/09/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 09/09/2014 |           | NOTICE of Hearing: Rule 16 Conference set for 10/8/2014 03:00 PM in Senior Judge Lagueux Chambers – Room 225 before Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux. (Cavaco, Janice) (Entered: 09/09/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 09/22/2014 | <u>13</u> | ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint, by City of Cranston, Rhode Island.(Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 09/22/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 10/01/2014 | <u>14</u> | RULE 16 STATEMENT by All Plaintiffs. (Labinger, Lynette) (Entered: 10/01/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| 10/08/2014 |           | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux: Rule 16 Conference held on 10/8/2014. Pretrial Order entered. (Cavaco, Janice) (Entered: 10/08/2014)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 10/08/2014 | <u>15</u> | PRETRIAL SCHEDULING ORDER: Factual Discovery due by 3/31/2015. Expert Discovery due by 6/30/2015. Plaintiffs' expert disclosures due by 4/30/15. Defendant's expert disclosures due by 5/30/15. Pretrial Memorandum due by 9/30/2015. So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 10/8/14. (Cavaco, Janice) (Entered: 10/08/2014)                                                                                                                                   |
| 07/09/2015 | <u>16</u> | MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. Responses due by 7/27/2015 (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supporting Memorandum, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C, # <u>5</u> Exhibit D, # <u>6</u> Exhibit E)(Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 07/09/2015)                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 07/14/2015 | <u>17</u> | Assented MOTION for an Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>16</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>to August 7, 2015</i> filed by All Plaintiffs. Responses due by 7/31/2015 (Labinger, Lynette) (Entered: 07/14/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 07/14/2015 | <u>18</u> | MOTION for an Extension of Time and for Leave to File Cross–Motion for Summary Judgment <i>on or before August 7, 2015</i> filed by All Plaintiffs. Responses due by 7/31/2015 (Labinger, Lynette) (Entered: 07/14/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 07/15/2015 |           | TEXT ORDER granting <u>17</u> Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply to <u>16</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment ( Responses due by 8/7/2015, Replies due by 8/17/2015.); granting <u>18</u> Motion for Extension of Time to File Cross Motion for Summary Judgment; Set/Reset Deadlines: ( Responses due by 8/7/2015, Replies due by 8/17/2015.). So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 7/15/2015. (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 07/15/2015) |
| 07/15/2015 | <u>19</u> | STATEMENT OF UNDISPUTED FACTS by City of Cranston, Rhode Island re <u>16</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . (Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 07/15/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| 08/06/2015 | <u>20</u> | RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>16</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>of the Defendant</i> WITH SUPPORTING MEMO filed by All Plaintiffs. Replies due by 8/17/2015. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supporting Memorandum Jointly Filed in Support of Plaintiffs' Objection and Plaintiffs' Cross–Motion for Summary Judgment)(Labinger, Lynette) (Entered: 08/06/2015)                                                                                                            |
| 08/06/2015 | <u>21</u> | Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>of the Plaintiffs</i> WITH SUPPORTING MEMO filed by All Plaintiffs. Responses due by 8/24/2015 (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supporting Memorandum Jointly Filed in Support of Plaintiffs' Objection and Plaintiffs' Cross–Motion for Summary Judgment)(Labinger, Lynette) (Entered: 08/06/2015)                                                                                                                                        |
| 08/06/2015 | <u>22</u> | STATEMENT OF DISPUTED FACTS by All Plaintiffs re <u>20</u> Response in Opposition to Motion, <u>21</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>of the Plaintiffs</i> . (Labinger, Lynette) (Entered: 08/06/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 08/06/2015 | <u>23</u> | STATEMENT OF UNDISPUTED FACTS by All Plaintiffs re <u>20</u> Response in Opposition to Motion, <u>21</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>of the Plaintiffs</i> .                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |

|            |           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|------------|-----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|            |           | (Labinger, Lynette) (Entered: 08/06/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 08/06/2015 | <u>24</u> | DECLARATION re <u>20</u> Response in Opposition to Motion, <u>21</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>of the Plaintiffs of Sean J. Young with Exhibits 1-26</i> by All Plaintiffs. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 18, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 19, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 20, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 21, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 22, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 23, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 24, # <u>25</u> Exhibit 25-part 1, # <u>26</u> Exhibit 25-part 2, # <u>27</u> Exhibit 26)(Labinger, Lynette) (Entered: 08/06/2015) |
| 08/12/2015 | <u>25</u> | Assented MOTION for an Extension of Time to Oppose Plaintiffs' Cross Motion for Summary Judgment filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. Responses due by 8/31/2015 (Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 08/12/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| 08/12/2015 | <u>26</u> | Assented MOTION for an Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>20</u> Response in Opposition to Motion, <i>for Summary Judgment</i> filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. Responses due by 8/31/2015 (Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 08/12/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 08/17/2015 |           | TEXT ORDER granting <u>25</u> Motion for Extension of Time for Defendant to respond to <u>21</u> Plaintiff's Cross Motion for Summary Judgment ; Set/Reset Deadlines: ( Responses due by 8/31/2015). So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 8/17/2015. (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 08/17/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 08/17/2015 |           | TEXT ORDER granting <u>26</u> Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply to Plaintiff's <u>20</u> Response in opposition to Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment ; Set/Reset Deadlines: Replies due by 8/31/2015. So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 8/17/2015. (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 08/17/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| 08/31/2015 | <u>27</u> | RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>21</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>of the Plaintiffs</i> filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. Replies due by 9/10/2015. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G)(Pellegrino, David) (Main Document 27 replaced on 9/2/2015) (Farrell Pletcher, Paula). (Entered: 08/31/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| 08/31/2015 | <u>28</u> | REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>20</u> Response in Opposition to Motion, filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G)(Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 08/31/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 08/31/2015 | <u>29</u> | RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION by City of Cranston, Rhode Island re <u>23</u> Statement of Undisputed Facts, <u>22</u> Statement of Disputed Facts . Replies due by 9/8/2015. (Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 08/31/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 09/03/2015 | <u>30</u> | Assented MOTION for an Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>29</u> Response in Opposition, <u>27</u> Response in Opposition to Motion, filed by All Plaintiffs. Responses due by 9/21/2015 (Lioz, Adam) (Entered: 09/03/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 09/08/2015 |           | TEXT ORDER granting <u>30</u> Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply re <u>30</u> Assented MOTION for an Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>29</u> Response in Opposition, <u>27</u> Response in Opposition to Motion, Responses due by 9/18/2015. So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 9/8/2015. (Cavaco, Janice) (Entered: 09/08/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 09/18/2015 | <u>31</u> | REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>27</u> Response in Opposition to Motion, filed by All Plaintiffs. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Affidavit)(Lioz, Adam) (Entered: 09/18/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 09/22/2015 |           | HEARING CANCELLED: Hearing on cross motions for summary judgment before Senior Judge Lagueux on 10/14/15 at 2:30 PM is CANCELLED. No future hearing date is set at this time. (Cavaco, Janice) (Entered: 09/22/2015)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 04/07/2016 | <u>32</u> | ORDER: In light of the United States Supreme Court's recent ruling in <i>Evenwel, et al vs. Abbott</i> , decided on April 4, 2016, the parties are provided thirty days to submit supplemental memoranda addressing the impact of <i>Evenwel</i> on this litigation. So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 4/7/2016. (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 04/07/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |

|            |           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|------------|-----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 04/13/2016 | <u>33</u> | RESPONSE in Support re <u>21</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment of the Plaintiffs filed by All Plaintiffs. (Lioz, Adam) (Entered: 04/13/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 05/05/2016 | <u>34</u> | SUPPLEMENTAL MEMORANDUM by City of Cranston, Rhode Island in support of <u>29</u> Response in Opposition . (Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 05/05/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 05/24/2016 | <u>35</u> | MEMORANDUM AND ORDER Re: <u>21</u> Motion for Summary Judgment, filed by American Civil Liberties Union of Rhode Island, Inc., Debbie Flitman, Karen Davidson, Sylvia Weber, Eugene Perry, <u>16</u> Motion for Summary Judgment, filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. Defendant's motion for summary judgment is denied and plaintiffs' motion for summary judgment is granted. The City of Cranston, Cranston City Council and the City's Board of Canvassers are enjoined from holding further elections under the current ward districting plan. The Cranston City Council shall have thirty days from the entry of this Order to propose a districting plan that complies with this Order.. So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 5/24/2016. (Cavaco, Janice) (Main Document 35 replaced on 5/24/2016) (Cavaco, Janice). (Entered: 05/24/2016) |
| 05/27/2016 | <u>36</u> | DECLARATORY JUDGMENT ENTERED in favor of American Civil Liberties Union of Rhode Island, Inc., Debbie Flitman, Eugene Perry, Karen Davidson, Sylvia Weber against City of Cranston, Rhode Island. (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 05/27/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| 05/27/2016 |           | TEXT ORDER VACATING <u>36</u> Declaratory Judgment. So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 5/27/2016. (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 05/27/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| 05/31/2016 | <u>37</u> | NOTICE OF APPEAL by City of Cranston, Rhode Island ( filing fee paid \$ 505.00, receipt number 0103-974419 )<br><br><b>NOTICE TO COUNSEL: Counsel should register for a First Circuit CM/ECF Appellate Filer Account at <a href="http://pacer.psc.uscourts.gov/cmecf/">http://pacer.psc.uscourts.gov/cmecf/</a>. Counsel should also review the First Circuit requirements for electronic filing by visiting the CM/ECF Information section at <a href="http://www.ca1.uscourts.gov/cmecf">http://www.ca1.uscourts.gov/cmecf</a></b> Appeal Record due by 6/7/2016. (Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 05/31/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 05/31/2016 | <u>38</u> | MOTION to Stay re <u>35</u> Memorandum and Order,,, filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. Responses due by 6/17/2016 (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supporting Memorandum, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B)(Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 05/31/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 05/31/2016 | <u>39</u> | MOTION to Expedite filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. Responses due by 6/17/2016 (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supporting Memorandum)(Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 05/31/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 06/01/2016 | <u>40</u> | CLERK'S CERTIFICATE AND APPELLATE COVER SHEET: Abbreviated record on appeal consisting of notice of appeal, order(s) being appealed, and a certified copy of the district court docket report transmitted to the U.S. Court of Appeals for the First Circuit in accordance with 1st Cir. R. 11.0(b). <u>37</u> Notice of Appeal. Documents Sent: 35, 37, 38, 39, 40. (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 06/01/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 06/01/2016 |           | USCA Case Number CCA16-1692 for <u>37</u> Notice of Appeal filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 06/01/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 06/01/2016 | <u>41</u> | NOTICE of Appearance by Robert K. Taylor on behalf of City of Cranston, Rhode Island (Taylor, Robert) (Entered: 06/01/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 06/03/2016 | <u>42</u> | RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>39</u> MOTION to Expedite WITH SUPPORTING MEMO filed by All Plaintiffs. Replies due by 6/13/2016. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supporting Memorandum)(Lioz, Adam) (Entered: 06/03/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 06/03/2016 | <u>43</u> | REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>42</u> Response in Opposition to Motion filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. (Pellegrino, David) (Entered: 06/03/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 06/07/2016 | <u>44</u> | ORDER denying <u>38</u> Motion to Stay. So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 6/7/2016. (Cavaco, Janice) (Entered: 06/07/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| 06/07/2016 | <u>45</u> | Supplemental Record on Appeal transmitted to U.S. Court of Appeals for The First Circuit. <u>37</u> Notice of Appeal. Unrestricted Documents Sent: Document #44. (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 06/07/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |

|            |           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|------------|-----------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 06/07/2016 | <u>46</u> | Assented MOTION for an Extension of Time to Apply by Motion for Attorneys Fees filed by All Plaintiffs. Responses due by 6/24/2016 (Lioz, Adam) (Entered: 06/07/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 06/08/2016 |           | TEXT ORDER granting <u>46</u> Assented To Motion for Extension of Time To Apply By Motion for Attorneys Fees. The time for filing fee applications is extended to 21 days after the Court enters a final declaratory judgment. So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 6/8/2016. (Cavaco, Janice) (Entered: 06/08/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 06/13/2016 | <u>47</u> | ORDER of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the First Circuit entered as to <u>37</u> Notice of Appeal, filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. Appellant's motion to replace Exhibit I in its motion for a stay is granted. Appellant's motion for a stay pending appeal and for expedited consideration of the appeal is granted. The appeal will proceed as follows: appellant's brief shall be filed by July 5, 2016; appellees' brief shall be filed by July 26, 2016; and any reply brief shall be filed by August 2, 2016. In light of the abbreviated briefing schedule, the paper copies of the briefs shall be put in the mail for overnight delivery on the same date the briefs are electronically filed. It is anticipated that the appeal will be scheduled for oral argument during the Court's September 2016 sitting. (Smith, Rana) (Entered: 06/13/2016) |
| 06/28/2016 | <u>48</u> | Supplemental Record on Appeal transmitted to U.S. Court of Appeals for The First Circuit. <u>37</u> Notice of Appeal. Unrestricted Documents Sent: #46 and Text Order granting motion. (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 06/28/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| 09/21/2016 | <u>49</u> | JUDGMENT of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the First Circuit entered as to <u>37</u> Notice of Appeal, filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. The order of the district court is reversed, and the case is remanded with instructions to enter summary judgment for the City of Cranston. (Smith, Rana) (Entered: 09/21/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 09/21/2016 | <u>50</u> | OPINION of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the First Circuit entered as to <u>37</u> Notice of Appeal, filed by City of Cranston, Rhode Island. (Smith, Rana) (Entered: 09/21/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 09/26/2016 |           | TEXT ORDER: Pursuant to the September 21, 2016 decision of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the First Circuit, the Clerk is hereby ordered to enter Summary Judgment in favor of the City of Cranston. Related to <u>49</u> Judgment of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the First Circuit. So Ordered by Senior Judge Ronald R. Lagueux on 9/26/2016. (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 09/26/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 09/26/2016 | <u>51</u> | CLERK'S JUDGMENT: Summary Judgment entered in favor of City of Cranston against American The Civil Liberties Union of Rhode Island, Inc., Debbie Flitman, Eugene Perry, Karen Davidson, Sylvia Weber. So Ordered by Deputy Clerk: on 9/26/2016. (Farrell Pletcher, Paula) (Entered: 09/26/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 10/31/2016 | <u>52</u> | MANDATE of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the First Circuit issued as to and in accordance with <u>49</u> Judgment of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the First Circuit. (Smith, Rana) (Entered: 10/31/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |